

### **CHEAT SHEET**

# Implicit Bias

How to mitigate the unconscious biases that harm patients in health care

Published - July 2020 • 5-min read

## Key takeaways

- Implicit biases, also called unconscious biases, are attitudes toward
  or stereotypes about groups of people that are made without
  consciously thinking about them. External forces, such as the news
  media, education, cultural narratives, and systemic inequities,
  powerfully shape and reinforce implicit attitudes and stereotypes.
- While bias is natural, these cognitive shortcuts can result in prejudgments that lead to rash decisions and discriminatory practices. This is evident in health care, where implicit bias contributes to worse health outcomes for certain groups of patients.
- Health care leaders and clinicians must take steps to mitigate the impact of implicit bias on patient experiences and outcomes.
   Organizations should focus efforts both on changing institutional processes that perpetuate structural biases and on helping clinicians understand and address the biases in their immediate control.

© 2020 Advisory Board • All rights reserved pg. 1



## What is it?

Implicit biases, also called unconscious biases, are attitudes toward or stereotypes about certain groups of people that are made without consciously thinking about them. These biases can influence a person's behavior and judgment without that person even knowing about it.

Humans often operate on autopilot, using mental shortcuts to make everyday decisions. While this may be efficient, it also can lead to people making decisions that don't align with their personal values. These cognitive shortcuts can lead to rash decisions and discriminatory behaviors that favor one group over another.

Some biases are hardwired in our brains. For example, in-group bias: favoring one's own group (based on team, race, religion, or other shared identities) over other groups. Or anchoring bias: being overly influenced by the first piece of information received.

However, people also learn biases from the news media, education systems, family behavior, systemic inequities, community norms, and other sources. These external factors shape and reinforce implicit biases. For example, in YouTube ads, women represent only 36% of speaking time, enforcing the idea that men have more valuable things to say than women. And in news and opinion media, there's a 32% overrepresentation of Black family poverty, perpetuating inaccurate representations of Black communities.

While implicit bias is not intentional, individuals and institutions must take responsibility and deliberate action to avoid acting on harmful biases.

<sup>1.</sup> Based on an analysis of 2.7 million YouTube advertisements globally.

<sup>2.</sup> Black families represent 59% of the poor in news and opinion media but make up just 27% of the poor in the U.S. By contrast, white families represent 17% of the poor in news and opinion media but make up 66% of the poor.



# Why does it matter?

Implicit biases influence how people interpret information, treat people, make decisions, and allocate resources. And bias operates on different levels: personal, institutional, and structural.

At the personal level, implicit bias can lead individuals to treat others unfairly or poorly. At an institutional or structural level, implicit bias can perpetuate systemic inequities and unjust outcomes. A biased policy—even if it wasn't designed with bias in mind—does not require individuals to personally act in biased ways for the negative impact to continue.

All of this is true in health care, too, as the graphic below illustrates.

How personal, institutional, and structural biases negatively impact patient care for Sharon, a fictional Black female patient

Personal	Sharon's doctor's implicit attitudes about race lead to Sharon not receiving the pain management medication appropriate for her condition.
Institutional	The health system's hiring channels unconsciously give preference to names that sound "white." When Sharon visits the hospital, she's treated by mostly white clinicians.
Structural	Lack of racial and gender diversity in clinical trials biases results toward the majority white male participants. The evidence-based care guidelines at Sharon's hospital's are based on these results.



Health care providers and leaders must examine how implicit bias results in worse health outcomes for some groups.

## **Examples of the effects of bias in health care include:**

- Physicians with an implicit pro-white bias are more likely to associate Black
  patients with being "less cooperative" and were less likely to refer Black
  patients with acute coronary symptoms for thrombolysis, the appropriate
  treatment.
- Women in one urban emergency room wait an average of 16 minutes longer than men to get medication when reporting abdominal pain and are less likely to receive it.
- African American patients reporting pain are 22% less likely than white patients to get pain medication from their doctors.

Implicit bias in health care is real and it's harming patients. Even if a person's bias is unconscious, it needs to be acknowledged. Health care providers must challenge assumptions and address implicit bias to better serve their patients and communities.



# What should we do?

Health care organizations should focus both on changing institutional processes that perpetuate structural biases and on helping clinicians address the biases in their immediate control.

The NeuroLeadership Institute created one framework to mitigate individual bias:

- Accept that the brain is biased to internalize that unconscious assumptions
  can lead people to overlook or ignore certain information.
- Label biases as they occur to acknowledge that they're there and decide the most effective strategy to mitigate that particular type of bias.
- Mitigate the bias by employing tools like if-then plans and decision guides to bypass the bias and make a more informed decision.

Ensure implicit bias training goes beyond theory and awareness. Training works best when people choose to participate and it addresses everyday situations.

Have clinicians reflect on where bias might arise in their encounters with patients. Then, help them plan for how to mitigate those biases through tools like shared decision-making and motivational interviewing. These strategies can help clinicians understand each patient as an individual rather than a stereotype and seek out additional data before making decisions.

It's crucial to help people plan for biased moments, but training will not eliminate biased decisions. Also consider how to embed preventive measures in workflows to remove triggers that activate or magnify bias in decisions. For example, hardwire evidence-based medicine protocols and embed care checklists.

Acknowledging and addressing unconscious bias is an ongoing process.

Organizations must build an inclusive culture that emphasizes the importance of different perspectives and backgrounds.

Source: "DECIDE," NeuroLeadership Institute; "How to Reduce Implicit Bias." Institute for Healthcare Improvement, September 28, 2017; "Everyday solutions to reduce implicit bias in health care." Healio. October 21, 2019; Marcelin J et al., "The Impact of Unconscious Bias in Healthcare: How to Recognize and Mitigate II." The Journal of Infection Diseases, August 20, 2019, Advisory Board interviews and analysis.



# Conversations you should be having

Collect and analyze data by race, ethnicity, gender, and other significant characteristics to identify disparities and look for situations where bias might be impacting care.

- Seek out anecdotes and feedback from employees and patients to investigate how implicit biases affect staff experience and care delivery at your organization.
- Develop a strategy to address implicit bias to improve care delivery, including training for leaders and clinicians with applicable steps to mitigate bias in the moment.
- Beyond just providing training sessions on bias, consider what policies and measures you can put in place across the organization and during patient interactions to prevent bias.

For each of these conversations, investigate what changes you can implement at an institutional level. It's critical to help individual staff members address their own implicit biases, but changing organization-wide policies and processes can amplify the impact even further.

© 2020 Advisory Board • All rights reserved pg. 6



# Related content

- CHEAT SHEET

  Motivational interviewing

  Read now
- CASE STUDY
  How Carolinas HealthCare trained staff on motivational interviewing
  Read now
- CHEAT SHEET
  Disparity in data
  Read now

TOOLKIT
Supporting resources to help physicians engage in shared decision making
Read now

© 2020 Advisory Board • All rights reserved pg. 7



## Project editors

Darby Sullivan sullivada@advisory.com 202-266-6714

Micha'le Simmons simmonsm@advisory.com 202-909-4351

## Project director

Rachel Zuckerman

### Research team

Heather Gardiner Karishma Manglani

#### LEGAL CAVEAT

Advisory Board has made efforts to verify the accuracy of the information it provides to members. This report relies on data obtained from many sources, however, and Advisory Board cannot guarantee the accuracy of the information provided or any analysis based thereon. In addition, Advisory Board is not in the business of giving legal, medical, accounting, or other professional advice, and its reports should not be construed as professional advice. In particular, members should not rely on any legal commentary in this report as a basis for action, or assume that any tactics described herein would be permitted by applicable law or appropriate for a given member's situation. Members are advised to consult with appropriate professionals concerning legal, medical, tax, or accounting issues, before implementing any of these tactics. Neither Advisory Board or its officers, directors, trustees, employees, and agents shall be liable for any claims, liabilities, or expenses relating to (a) any errors or omissions in this report, whether caused by Advisory Board or any of its employees or agents, or curves or other third parties, (b) any recommendation or graded ranking by Advisory Board, or (c) failure of member and its employees and agents to abide by the terms set forth herein.

Advisory Board and the "A" logo are registered trademarks of The Advisory Board Company in the United States and other countries. Members are not permitted to use these trademarks, or any other trademark, product name, service name, trade name, and logo of Advisory Board without prior written consent of Advisory Board. All other trademarks, product names, service names, trade names, and logos used within these pages are the property of their respective holders. Use of other company trademarks, product names, service names, trade names, and logos or images of the same does not necessarily constitute (a) an endorsement by such company of Advisory Board and troducts and services, or (b) an endorsement of the company or its products and services, or (b) an endorsement of the company or its products or services by Advisory Board. Advisory Board is not affiliated with any such company.

### IMPORTANT: Please read the following.

Advisory Board has prepared this report for the exclusive use of its members. Each member acknowledges and agrees that this report and the information contained herein (collectively, the "Report") are confidential and proprietary to Advisory Board. By accepting delivery of this Report, each member agrees to abide by the terms as stated herein, including the following:

- Advisory Board owns all right, title, and interest in and to this Report. Except as stated herein, no right, license, permission, or interest of any kind in this Report is intended to be given, transferred to, or acquired by a member. Each member is authorized to use this Report only to the extent expressly authorized herein.
- Each member shall not sell, license, republish, or post online or otherwise this Report, in part or in whole. Each member shall not disseminate or permit the use of, and shall take reasonable precautions to prevent such dissemination or use of, this Report by (a) any of its employees and agents (except as stated below), or (b) any third party.
- 3. Each member may make this Report available solely to those of its employees and agents who (a) are registered for the workshop or membership program of which this Report is a part, (b) require access to this Report in order to learn from the information described herein, and (c) agree not to disclose this Report to other employees or agents or any third party. Each member shall use, and shall ensure that its employees and agents use, this Report for its internal use only. Each member may make a limited number of copies, solely as adequate for use by its employees and agents in accordance with the terms herein.
- 4. Each member shall not remove from this Report any confidential markings, copyright notices, and/or other similar indicia herein
- 5. Each member is responsible for any breach of its obligations as stated herein by any of its employees or agents.
- 6. If a member is unwilling to abide by any of the foregoing obligations, then such member shall promptly return this Report and all copies thereof to Advisory Board.

© 2020 Advisory Board • All rights reserved pg. 8



655 New York Avenue NW, Washington DC 20001 202-266-5600 | advisory.com