# Win Talent in a <br> Candidate-Centric Market 

A playbook for recruiting in a competitive labor market

Look inside to learn how to:

- Make applying a no-brainer
- Ensure recruiters can spot the right talent
- Equip hiring managers with tools to win top candidates



## LEARN HOW TO

- Improve your application process to prevent strong candidates from giving up part-way through
- Ensure recruiters can screen candidates for more than technical skill
- Create a realistic candidate profile
- Harness the power of employee networks to source referrals
- Tap into overlooked candidate pools


# Win Talent in a Candidate-Centric Market 

A playbook for recruiting in a competitive labor market

## HR Advancement Center

Project Director<br>Mack Kelly<br>kellym@advisory.com<br>202-266-6141

Micha'le Simmons, MHA
simmonsm@advisory.com
202-909-4351

Contributing Consultants
Phoebe Draper

Design Consultant
Lilith James

Managing Director
Jennifer Stewart

Executive Director
Steven Berkow, JD

## LEGAL CAVEAT

Advisory Board is a division of The Advisory Board Company. Advisory Board has made efforts to verify the accuracy of the information it provides to
members. This report relies on data obtained from many sources, however, and Advisory Board cannot guarantee the accuracy of the information provided or any analysis based thereon. In addition, Advisory Board is not in the business of giving legal, medical accounting, or other professional advice, and its reports should not be construed as professional advice. In particular, members should not rely on any legal commentary in this report as a basis for action or assume that any tactics described herein would be permitted by applicable law or appropriat for a given member's situation. Members are advised to consult with appropriate professional concerning legal, medical, tax, or accounting issues before implementing any of these tactics. Neither Advisory Board nor its officers, directors, trustees, employees, and agents shall be liable for any claims, liabilities, or expenses relating to (a) any errors or omissions in this report, whether caused by Advisory Board or any of its employees or agents, or sources or other third parties, (b) any recommendation or graded ranking by Advisory Board, or (c) failure of member and its employees and agents to abide by the terms set forth herein.
The Advisory Board Company and the " $A$ " logo are registered trademarks of The Advisory Board Company in the United States and other countries. Members are not permitted to use these
trademarks, or any other trademark, product name service name, trade name, and logo of Advisory Board without prior written consent of Advisory Board. All other trademarks, product names, service names, trade names, and logos used within these pages are the property of their respective holders. Use of other company trademarks, product names service names, trade names, and logos or images of the same does not necessarily constitute (a) an endorsement by such company of Advisory Board and its products and services, or (b) an
endorsement of the company or its products or services by Advisory Board. Advisory Board is not affiliated with any such company.

IMPORTANT: Please read the following.
Advisory Board has prepared this report for the exclusive use of its members. Each member acknowledges and agrees that this report and the information contained herein (collectively, the "Report") are confidential and proprietary to Advisory Board. By accepting delivery of this Report, each member agrees to abide by the terms as stated herein, including the following:

1. Advisory Board owns all right, title, and interest in and to this Report. Except as stated herein, no right, license, permission, or interest of any kind in this Report is intended to be given, transferred to, or acquired by a member. Each member is authorized to use this Report only to the extent expressly authorized herein.
2. Each member shall not sell, license, republish, or post online or otherwise this Report, in part or in whole. Each member shall not disseminate permit the use of, and shall take reasonable recautions to prevent such dissemination or use of, this Report by (a) any of its employee and agents (except as stated below), or (b) any third party
3. Each member may make this Report available solely to those of its employees and agents who (a) are registered for the workshop or membership program of which this Report is a part, (b) require access to this Report in order to earn from the information described herein, and (c) agree not to disclose this Report to other mployees or agents or any third party. Eac member shall use, and shall ensure that its employees and agents use, this Report for its internal use only. Each member may make a limited number of copies, solely as adequate for use by its employees and agents in accordance with the terms herein
4. Each member shall not remove from this Repor any confidential markings, copyright notices, and/or other similar indicia herein.
5. Each member is responsible for any breach of its obligations as stated herein by any of its employees or agents
6. If a member is unwilling to abide by any of the foregoing obligations, then such member shall promptly return this Report and all copies thereof to Advisory Board.

## Table of Contents

Executive Summary ..... 5
HR Advancement Center Essay: Take a Candidate-Centric Approach ..... 7
Strategy 1: Make Applying a No-Brainer ..... 17
Practice 1: Personalized Job Postings ..... 19
Practice 2: On-Demand Recruiter ..... 24
Strategy 2: Distinguish Top Prospects for Hiring Managers ..... 29
Practice 3: Candidate Profile Negotiation ..... 31
Practice 4: Recruiter Role Immersion ..... 36
Practice 5: Pre-hire Screens ..... 41
Practice 6: Runner-Up Hiring ..... 44
Strategy 3: Prepare Hiring Managers to Close the Deal Fast ..... 49
Practice 7: Fast-Track Interviews ..... 51
Practice 8: Interviewer's Cheat Sheet ..... 54
Practice 9: Same-Day Offers ..... 58
Strategy 4: Court Passive Talent for Future Employment ..... 61
Practice 10: No-Strings Professional Development ..... 63
Practice 11: Employee Referral Program ..... 67
Practice 12: Under-Tapped Candidate Pools ..... 72

## Advisors to Our Work

The HR Advancement Center is grateful to the individuals and organizations that shared their insights, analysis, and time with us. The research team would especially like to recognize the following individuals for being particularly generous with their time and expertise.

## With Sincere Appreciation

## Cambridge Health Alliance

Cambridge, MA
Joy Curtis
Johns Hopkins Hospital
Baltimore, MD
Michele Sedney
Mosaic Life Care
St. Joseph, MO
Janelle Lee
Taylor Laney

## Novant Health

Winston-Salem, NC
Susan Brooks
Janet Smith-Hill
Pegged Software
Baltimore, MD
Michael Finn
Myra Norton
Michael Rosenbaum

## Providence Health and Services

Renton, WA
Meg Steele

## Scripps Health

San Diego, CA
Jack Blake

## Stanford Health Care

Stanford, CA
Lori Burt
Kety Duron

## University of Missouri Health Care

Columbia, MO
Peter Callan
UPMC
Pittsburgh, PA
Pam Arroyo
Natalie Bell
Lauren Lloyd
Virtua Health System
Camden, NJ
Gary Burmylo
Rhonda Jordan

## Executive Summary

## Health Care Organizations Face a Tightening Labor Market

As of the middle of 2016, all signs point to an emerging national labor shortage. Vacancy rates are at an all-time high, reaching $6.2 \%$ in 2015, nearly doubling the 2009 vacancy rate. Just as organizations struggle to fill positions, demand for health care talent is also projected to increase over the next ten years. Over the next decade, the Bureau of Labor Statistics estimates that health care employment will increase by 19.8\%, compared to $6.5 \%$ for all industries.

## Health Care Leaders Can't "Dust Off" Recruiting Playbooks from the Last Labor Shortage

While health care leaders have faced labor shortages before, their tried-and-true strategies from the last shortage won't suffice. One reason why is inpatient providers are increasingly competing with nontraditional health care providers such as Walgreens and CVS, who offer a different hiring process and work environment.

Furthermore, new technologies have transformed the recruiting process. Online applications make it easier for candidates to apply to multiple organizations at the same time, which also means it is more challenging for health care providers to differentiate themselves from other employers, and also more challenging for recruiters to find applicants who are the best fit. In addition, social media allows candidates to evaluate (and judge) potential employers before employers reach out.

## How to Build a Candidate-Centric Recruiting Playbook

This publication outlines how you can build a new recruiting playbook to win talent in a candidate's market. We provide 12 best practices that will help you shift towards a candidate-centric approach to recruiting and successfully engage passive candidates. You will learn to:

- Improve your application process to prevent strong candidates from giving up partway through the application
- Ensure recruiters can screen candidates for more than technical skills
- Equip hiring managers to sell top candidates on the organization
- Get passive talent to consider you as a future employer
- Take a Candidate-Centric Approach

As of the middle of 2016, all signs point to an emerging national labor shortage. The Center's Annual Turnover, Vacancy and Premium Labor Benchmarks reveal a troubling trend: vacancy rates have been steadily rising for the past six years.

Looking ahead, Bureau of Labor Statistics data suggests the health care labor market will only tighten in the coming decade. Health care employment is projected to grow three times more than the "all industry" average. One in four new jobs in the United States will be in health care.

## Time to Break Out the Shortage Playbook

Median Health Care Vacancy Rates (FTEs), 2009-2015
$\mathrm{n}=280^{1}$


Projected Increase in Employment, 2014-2024
19.8\%
 the next decade will be in health care

To respond to the tightening labor market, many HR leaders have poured time, energy, and resources into improving recruiting-but all-too-often haven't seen a return on their investment.

Since 2011, health care recruitment spending rose $16 \%$, outpacing all other industries. Yet, at the same time, performance on key recruitment metrics is declining. Time-to-fill has increased by four days since 2013, and first year turnover increased $28 \%$ from 2013 to 2015.

Many HR leaders fail to see their recruiting investments translate into improved performance due to reliance on outdated recruitment playbooks. Recruiting playbooks created during previous labor shortages don't account for two recent, major disruptions in the health care labor market.

## Playbooks from the Last Shortage No Longer Sufficient

## Health Care Recruitment Spending Growth Outpacing All Industries

16\% Increase in health care recruitment spending since 2011-the largest spending increase of any industry

Rapid Growth in Time-to-Fill and First-Year Turnover

Rise in the percentage of overall turnover due to employees leaving with less than one year of tenure from 2013 to 2015

4 days
Increase in median time-to-fill for all positions, 2013-2015

The first recent, major disruption to the health care labor market is increased competition for staff. This is fueled in part by the shift towards value based care, the need to fill newly created positions, as well as a need to deploy staff differently than in the past (e.g., expanding the use of medical assistants in primary care).

Increased competition for staff is also fueled by the rapid increase of nontraditional health care providers. While hospitals were once the only employer seeking to employ clinicians, nontraditional competitors like CVS and Walmart now actively seek to hire clinical staff. And these nontraditional providers can often offer more appealing schedules and more diverse career opportunities than hospitals.

## Hospitals Facing Increased Competition for Staff

New Care Models Increase<br>Demand for Select Staff



New care models require new roles and competencies

## Nontraditional Competitors Seek to Hire Clinical Staff



Walgreens

## Walmart <br> save money, Live better.

Retail competitors offer less stressful environment and more appealing hours

The second recent, major disruption to the health care labor market is new recruiting technology. Since the previous labor shortage, the application process has been automated.
The upside is that online applications are more accessible and (in theory) easier to complete and process. The downside is application volume: the easier it is to apply, the more applicants you receive who aren't qualified. In addition, a wholly automated process depersonalizes your organization, and candidates often don't make a meaningful connection with your organization until far too late in the process.

Since the previous labor shortage, social media has exploded in popularity. On the recruiting front, the upside is you have more channels (e.g., Facebook, Twitter) to share job openings and your employment brand. The downside is these outlets also allow candidates to screen you before you screen them. They can easily find both positive and negative reviews of your organization and form an opinion of your organization before they connect with you.

The result of the emergence of new technologies and the increased competition for staff, is that recruiting playbooks from previous labor shortages are outdated and insufficient.

# New Technologies Upend the Recruiting Game 



## Automation Impacts Application Volume and Communications

- Reduces interpersonal communications with candidates
- For some positions, application volume is higher; more difficult to separate the wheat from the chaff
- For positions where talent is in short supply, long applications a barrier to engaging candidates


## $\stackrel{0}{0}-0$

## Social Media Allows Candidates to Evaluate Us Before We Evaluate Them

- Candidates visit up to 12 sources when job searching
- Social media and websites like Glassdoor may define employer reputation and disrupt candidate channels

To successfully recruit candidates in this current labor market you need to build a new recruiting playbook. Your new playbook must reflect two key principles. First, candidatedriven markets require a candidate-centric approach to recruiting. However, the vast majority of health care organizations do not use a candidate-centric approach. Instead, they offer the employercentric approach shown on the left. This means candidates endure a long, convoluted process and spend an inordinate amount of time waiting.

In order to successfully compete in a tight labor market, you need to adopt the candidate-centric approach shown on the right. This means that the application process is easy, responsive, and personalized to the candidate. The candidatecentric approach will make you more competitive because candidates will hear from you faster and have a more positive impression of your organization.

## Two Strikingly Different Candidate Experiences

## Employer-Centric

Stumbles on daunting, requirementheavy job description

Spends 1-2 hours completing lengthy application

Experiences "radio silence" for 2+ weeks

Eventually has impersonal interview with hiring manager focused on needs of organization

Receives offer several weeks later

Organizations taking this status quo approach to recruiting

Receives offer within a few days
Spends 3 minutes to "express interest" in posted position

Receives phone call from recruiter within one day

Enjoys stimulating interview with hiring manager who promotes employee value proposition and sells the job

## Candidate-Centric

Quickly finds clear, concise job posting

Organizations reaping competitive advantage of candidate-centric recruiting

The second principle to build your new recruiting playbook is to not only focus on active jobseekers but also on passive candidates currently employed elsewhere. In a candidate-driven market most of your potential candidates are already employed; to secure the best talent you must identify a strategy that attracts passive talent. As the data here shows, many employed health care professions are open to discussing opportunities with recruiters.

While it may seem "unsportsmanlike" to focus on attracting candidates currently employed elsewhere, the reality is that increasingly low unemployment rates will require most organizations to do so. Keep in mind, this means your competitors are also likely to try to attract your own employees.

## Reaching Beyond Active Jobseekers

Percentage of Employed Workers ${ }^{1}$
Open to New Job Opportunities, 2015


## Percentage of Employed Workers Interested in Hearing from Recruiters, 2015


"Gone are the days of finding someone on the job board. The good people are working. The job boards assemble the best of the unemployed or the best of the unhappy. We want the best of the passive."

Director of Talent Acquisition Three-Hospital Health System in the Southeast

The challenge is that even with these two core principles at the heart of your new recruiting playbook-adopting a candidate centric approach and expanding outreach to passive candidates-there is a seemingly overwhelming number of potential practices. Researchers at The Center spoke to more than 100 HR leaders to identify which limited number of recruitment best practices will best bring the two core principles to life and have the greatest impact on your organization's ability to win a greater share of talent in a competitive market. You see them on the next page.

A Sea of Potential Recruiting Strategies to Pursue

Enhance Search Engine Optimization


## A New Playbook for Finding Talent Amid Shortage

Here is your new playbook for finding talent amid shortage.

The first three strategies improve your appeal to candidates and streamline the hiring process. These are essential strategies you need to start executing immediately; otherwise, you risk being disadvantaged in a competitive market for talent.

The first strategy focuses on making applying to your organization a "no brainer." This requires removing any barriers that keep interested, qualified candidates from applying to your organization. The second strategy focuses on helping recruiters better distinguish top prospects, in order to refer fewer candidates to hiring managers. This will prevent hiring managers from wasting time on sub-par candidates and elevate HR credibility. The third strategy focuses on equipping your hiring managers to interview top candidates quickly and sell top candidates on the position and the organization.

The fourth and final strategy will help your organization successfully recruit passive candidates. While it is as important as the first three, this strategy will pay dividends over a longer timeframe. The rest of this publication provides additional guidance on each strategy and best practices to bring each strategy to life.

## Essential Strategies to Compete for Talent Today

| 1 | 2 | $3$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Make Applying a No-Brainer | Distinguish Top Prospects for Hiring Managers | Prepare Managers to Close the Deal Fast |
| 1. Personalized Job Postings | Develop the Ideal Candidate Profile | 7. Fast-Track Interviews |
| 2. On-Demand Recruiter | 3. Candidate Profile Negotiation | 8. Interviewer's Cheat Sheet |
|  | 4. Recruiter Role Immersion | 9. Same-Day Offers |
|  | Screen Beyond Technical Skills |  |
|  | 5. Pre-hire Screens |  |
|  | 6. Runner-Up Hiring |  |

## Recommended Strategy to Cultivate Talent Over Time

## 4

## Court Passive Talent for Future Employment

10. No-Strings Professional Development
11. Employee Referral Program
12. Under-Tapped Candidate Pools

## - Make Applying a No-Brainer

Practice 1: Personalized Job Postings
Practice 2: On-Demand Recruiter

The first must-do strategy for building your new recruiting playbook is to make applying to your organization a "nobrainer". You must remove barriers that keep interested, qualified candidates from completing an application. The goal is to design a candidate-centric application process that is easy, responsive, and personalized so that candidates are compelled to apply. Organizations miss out on a significant number of applicants because of the length and complexity of their application. Up to 60\% of job seekers abandon their application before it is completed.

Answer these questions to determine how much opportunity your organization has to build a more candidatecentric application process. Each answer of "no" indicates room for improvement. Two or more 'no' answers indicate applicants may encounter more reasons not to apply than to apply.

The two best practices in this section will help you build an application process that draws candidates in-rather than push them away.

## The High Cost of a Bad First Impression

Percentage of Job Seekers Who Have<br>Quit an Application in the Middle<br>Due to Its Length/Complexity



## Building a More Candidate-Centric Approach

A Downhill Slope or an Olympic Trial?

## Red Flag Audit for your Application Process

From your main page, can you apply to positions in
3 clicks or less?Can a candidate see a full job posting in one page (screen)?
Does a targeted search (e.g., ICU nurse, part-time) yield less than 25 results?Can you differentiate your job posting from the same position at your competitors (aside from the description of the organization)?Can candidates communicate directly with a recruiter before they've submitted an application?

## Practice 1

## Personalized Job Postings

## Practice in Brief

HR creates attention-grabbing, candidate-centric job postings-rather than relying on an existing job description.

## Rationale

To attract the best candidates, job postings should capture why a candidate should want to apply at your organization, and not with a competitor.

At most organizations, job postings are a direct copy of the job description and disproportionately focus on the needed technical qualifications. The problem with this approach is: job descriptions aren't designed to spark candidate interest in a role. Furthermore, job descriptions rarely contain enough information to help a candidate decide whether the job (and your organization) is a good fit.

## Implementation Components

## Component 1: Tell Candidates What It Takes to Be Successful

The job posting should feature the competencies and/or behaviors (not just technical skills) that it takes to succeed.

## Component 2: Highlight Professional Growth Opportunities

The job posting should include an easily accessible link to a web page that highlights all the learning and advancement opportunities available for those in this role.

## Component 3: Facilitate Connections with Current Employees

The job posting should include a direct link to social media (e.g., Linkedln) that allows candidates to find the people they know who already work at your organization.

## Practice Assessment

Many organizations have job postings that are designed to meet organizational needs and not appeal to candidates, so even small improvements can make a big difference to the candidate experience. If you have limited time and resources, you can pick and choose which component to pursue (they do not need to be done sequentially).

## HR Advancement Center Grades

Practice Impact: B
Ease of Implementation: A-

When a candidate considers applying to an organization, they often rely on the job posting to understand the role and the organization. However, allindustry data shows job postings are often missing key information that would entice candidates to apply.

To create more compelling job postings that appeal to candidates, a job posting should accomplish three things: define success, share a vision for future opportunities, and offer a connection. In other words, applicants need to know what it takes to succeed in the role, what growth opportunities are available, and which employees they can connect with. The following pages provide additional guidance on each component.

## Job Postings: A Missed Opportunity to Sell Candidates

Key Decision Criteria for Job Seekers



Health care job seekers who found it challenging to find a job they felt qualified to do


Health care job seekers looking for information about health care career paths when job searching


Job seekers who find the search experience more difficult since applying online is pointless without a personal connection with a current employee

## Craft a Job Posting with a Personal Touch

## The Elements of Your Pitch

Define
Success


Job posting shows more than the job duties-also gives insight into the qualities of a successful candidate

Share a Vision


Candidates know what career paths and development opportunities are available to them, especially for hard-to-fill roles

Offer
a Connection

## Careers site is

 linked to relevant social media so that candidates can quickly find out who they know at your organization
## Component 1: Tell Candidates What It Takes to Be Successful

The first component of this practice is to provide candidates with information on what it takes to succeed in the role-beyond the basic job qualifications.

Virtua Health System in southern New Jersey designed visual job postings that include pie charts with the competencies required to succeed in a role. For each role, HR defines the competencies required and the relative weighting. For example, a physical therapist needs to be patient-focused, decisive, and a strong communicator. On the other hand, the medical technologist visual job posting emphasizes flexibility, conscientiousness, accuracy, and ethics.

Full Visual Job Posting available at advisory.com/hrac/ wintalent

## Share Success Criteria on the Job Posting

## Virtua's Physical Therapist Visual Job Posting



## Case in Brief: Virtua Health System

- Three-hospital nonprofit health care system located in southern New Jersey
- Health system executives fully centralized recruitment in 2014, divided into three teams aligned with nursing, allied health, and support staff
- All teams include client-facing Talent Acquisition Consultant who works with hiring managers, candidate-facing Relationship Specialists who source talent, and an Experience Coordinator to facilitate onboarding
- Recognized the importance of the job posting as an initial step to draw in strong applicants. Developed graphically-engaging, candidate-centric job postings to highlight personal attributes necessary to succeed in the role and abbreviated descriptions written to promote the role rather than posting the job description
- Pie charts illustrate the responsibilities and competencies of each position, with relative importance of each determined by HR and compensation teams


## Component 2: Highlight Professional Growth Opportunities

The second component is to highlight how the open position is the first step in a compelling career path. The job posting should spotlight learning opportunities available to those in the role as well as long-term career path options.

Mayo Clinic, headquartered in Rochester, MN, created career profiles for some of the organization's most critical positions, including nursing, clinical labs, and pharmacy. These profiles include videos of current staff, educational opportunities for career advancement (e.g., a perioperative nursing program), and a link to upcoming learning and development courses. All of this information can be accessed in just one click from Mayo's job postings.

## Chart a Compelling Career Path for Candidates

## Mayo Clinic Nursing Career Profile



## Component 3: Facilitate Connections with Current Employees

The third component is to help candidates connect with current employees at your organization.

Cambridge Health Alliance (CHA) in Cambridge, MA embedded Linkedln's "Company Insider" widget alongside their job postings. Once a candidate clicks on the widget it automatically generates a list of CHA employees who are in their personal network. Candidates can then choose to reach out to any of those employees for additional information or a referral.

Linkedln offers several tools such as Company Insider that organizations can embed on their website free of charge. For more information, visit the resources page for this publication.

Linkedln Plugins webpage available at advisory.com/ hrac/wintalent

## Connect Candidates with Employees in Their Network

## Cambridge Health Alliance Job Posting



## Practice 2

## On-Demand Recruiter

## Practice in Brief

Candidates have real-time access to recruiters before they submit an application. This allows candidates to make a personal connection, ask questions, and find the right opportunity. The goal is to encourage more prospective candidates to complete an application.

## Rationale

The earliest that most candidates connect with a recruiter is after they've submitted an application. But if candidates are made to wait too long to make a personal connection, they can lose interest in the open position. Even worse, qualified candidates may abandon their application if they can't get their questions answered.

## Implementation Components

Option 1: Timely Contact with Vetted Contacts
Candidates fill out a quick (no more than 5 minute) survey to identify their role preferences and experience level. Based on the survey results, recruiters follow up with candidates within 48 hours to discuss opportunities and to begin to sell the organization. The survey helps protect recruiter time and helps recruiters prioritize candidates for follow-up.

## Option 2: Instant Access for All Interested Parties

Candidates can connect with a recruiter via a chat function or a hotline during designated hours. The goal is to give all candidates immediate access to recruiters so that they can ask questions before they apply.

## Practice Assessment

Both options can be integrated into existing recruiter workflows more easily than you may suspect. While the first option may seem easier and lower-tech, don't overlook the chat function. Ask your internal IT team how feasible it would be to build a chat function in-house. Your organization may already be using a similar technology to chat with patients and may be able to repurpose it for candidates.

## HR Advancement Center Grades

Practice Impact: A-
Ease of Implementation: C+

While technology has automated the application process, candidates still expect to hear directly from recruiters. Survey data from job seekers reinforces that the majority of candidates not only expect communication throughout the process, but that they also want it to be personalized. After they apply, candidates want recruiters to call them directly to follow-up. And candidates want communication to be tailored to them-not just a mass, automatic email sent by your applicant tracking system.

## Option 1: Timely Contact with Vetted Contacts

The first option for providing candidates earlier access to your recruiting team is to build a short survey for candidates to complete. This will help recruiters prioritize which candidates they reach out to first.

SSM Health headquartered in St. Louis, MO uses this short survey to prioritize which nursing candidates to call. In lieu of completing a full application, nurse candidates can complete a short form with less than 10 multiple choice questions. On average, it takes applicants only three minutes to complete. Recruiters use the information on the survey to follow up with candidates to discuss appropriate opportunities and begin generating interest in SSM.

## Candidates Expect More Communication, Earlier On

Candidates Expect Personalized Communication...



Candidates who responded 'yes' to "Do you expect more personalized communication?"

## ..And They Expect a Call from a Recruiter After Applying



Candidates who answered 'yes' to "Do you expect a call from a recruiter or hiring manager after submitting your application?"

## SSM Using Quick Submit Form to Prioritize Follow-Up

## SSM Nursing Quick Submit Form

(Optional) Attach Resume Here

Years of
Experience: O Graduate ○ 0-1 Year ○ 1-2 Years $\bigcirc 2+$ Ye


Survey asks multiple-choice questions about candidate's experience and preferences to determine the right role

## Survey format

 allows candidates to complete form in 3 minutes or less
## Option 2: Instant Access for All Interested Parties

The second option for providing candidates earlier access to your recruiting team is to use a hotline or chat function to provide direct access.

Novant Health, headquartered in Winston-Salem, NC, partnered with their IT team to embed a chat function on their career site. Recruiters staff the hotline Monday through Thursday during business hours. Half of the recruitment team supports the chat function each day.
Recruiters support the chat line in addition to their regular duties. They answer candidate chats as needed but are able to remove themselves from the chat queue when necessary (for instance, if they need to conduct an in-person interview).

## Answers on Demand Before Applying at Novant Health



## Case in Brief: Novant Health

- Four-state integrated network of physician clinics, outpatient centers, and hospitals, including 13 medical centers
- Piloted a chat function on its careers website in 2014 in collaboration with the IT department
- Chat function staffed Monday through Thursday by recruiters; recruiters may remove themselves from the queue when unavailable. Half of recruiters responsible for Monday, Wednesday and half responsible for Tuesday, Thursday
- Recruiters interact with approximately 60 candidates a day via the chat function
- Using the chat function, Novant Health also hosts three-hour virtual career fairs advertised for a specific role or job family
- During virtual career fairs recruiters chat with attendees one-on-one and answer questions about the role; top candidates are connected to on-call hiring manager by phone the same day and pre-vetted for an in-person interview
- A recent virtual career fair targeting RNs for the centralized staffing office attracted 19 candidates, with four hires

Novant was also able to leverage this technology for virtual hiring events. Recruiters use the chat function to conduct online hiring events for indemand roles. Candidates can chat one-on-one with a recruiter at any time during the event and ask specific questions about the jobs available. The example shown here illustrates how Novant advertised a virtual career fair for the RN float pool.

## Targeting Urgent Hiring Needs Through Virtual Events



## Hiring Managers Stand by for Top Candidates

## Hiring Managers' Role in Virtual Career Fairs at Novant Health

## Before Virtual Career Fair



Recruiter alerts relevant hiring managers about upcoming job fair


Hiring manager holds calendar to be on standby or identifies a back up contact for recruiter

During Virtual Job Fair


Recruiter chats with qualified candidate who merits time with hiring manager


Hiring manager calls applicant to vet them for an in-person interview and sell them on the culture at Novant Health

Novant's virtual job fairs have helped recruiters quickly and cost-effectively fill open positions. As an example, a virtual job fair for centralized staffing office nurses allowed Novant to hire four nurses from a pool of 19 attendees.

Additionally, faster hand-offs between recruiters and hiring managers during these events cuts the time to the final interview in half.

To help you weigh the trade-offs between the two options for providing candidates earlier access to recruiters, this table highlights the advantages and disadvantages of each option.

The advantage of both is the same: they allow candidates to get answers to their questions and make a connection with your organization early in the application process. While vetting candidates before connecting them with a recruiter is a simple, low-cost option, it can result in candidate drop-off (especially if recruiters don't follow up quickly). In contrast, instant access reduces the risk of candidate drop-off but can be more time consuming for your team and take longer to pilot.

## Capturing More Candidates with Real-Time Access

Percentage of Virtual Career Fair Attendees Hired

Centralized Staffing Office Nurses $\mathrm{n}=19$

12


## Weighing Instant Versus Timely Access to Your Team




Instant Access with All Interested Parties

- Recruiters build a connection with candidates before they submit an application
- Candidates appreciate an easy way to get immediate answers to their questions
- Recruiters may waste precious time speaking with unqualified candidates
- Assessing fit in the moment is difficult, recruiters start conversation without information on candidate's background or interests


# - Distinguish Top Prospects for Hiring Managers 

Develop the Ideal Candidate Profile<br>Practice 3: Candidate Profile Negotiation<br>Practice 4: Recruiter Role Immersion<br>Screen Beyond Technical Skills<br>Practice 5: Pre-hire Screens<br>Practice 6: Runner-Up Hiring

The second must-do strategy for building your new recruiting playbook is to equip your recruiters to distinguish top prospects for hiring managers. Too often, recruiters don't have a complete picture of what separates a great candidate from a mediocre one. As a result, hiring managers don't trust their recommendations. This can become a downward spiral that erodes the recruiterhiring manager partnership and in turn drives up time-to-fill.

To succeed, organizations need to ensure their recruiters can identify a candidate that is the right fit for the job, the team, and the organization-not just one who meets the minimum qualifications. This means having the knowledge and discernment to send only a handful of the top candidates, rather than a laundry list of mediocre ones.

Answer these questions to determine how much opportunity your recruiters have to better distinguish top prospects for managers. Each "no" answer indicates room for improvement. Two or more 'no' answers indicates there is opportunity to further improve the working relationship between recruiters and hiring managers.

The best practices in this section will help ensure your recruiters better distinguish top candidates by developing realistic candidate profiles and effectively screening candidates against that profile.

## A Relationship on the Verge of Spinning Out of Control



Time to fill goes up, recruiter credibility falls

## Trusted Partner or Tolerated Nuisance?

## Red Flag Audit for Your Recruiter's Ability to Identify Top Prospects

Do recruiters negotiate with hiring managers on qualifications and candidate profiles?Do recruiters screen for more than technical skills?Do recruiters know more about the positions they're recruiting for than what's in the job description?


Are recruiters passing along seven or fewer resumes per requisition to the hiring manager?

## Practice 3

## Candidate Profile Negotiation

## Practice in Brief

As soon as a requisition is filed, recruiters meet with hiring managers to mutually agree on which candidate criteria are "nice-to-have" versus "need-to-have." The goal is for the recruiter to avoid wasting time searching for candidates with the wrong (or unattainable) qualifications.

## Rationale

Many recruiters default into serving as "order-takers" for hiring managers, searching for candidates who meet a long list of qualifications. Since recruiters often can't find a candidate with all the qualifications, they begin to make decisions about which qualifications are most important. If managers aren't included in these trade-offs, they are inevitably disappointed with candidates and the positions remain open longer.

## Implementation Components

## (Optional) Component 1: Use Data to Show What Talent is Available in the Market

The recruiter provides the hiring manager with data showing which of the manager's desired qualifications are readily available and which would be hard to find, so the manager can make more informed tradeoffs.

## Component 2: Ask Questions to Surface Trade-Offs Between Candidate Qualifications

The recruiter asks the hiring manager targeted questions to isolate the "must-have" qualifications for the role.

## (Optional) Component 3: Get Manager Feedback on Where to Source Candidates

The recruiter draws on the hiring manager's expertise and social networks to identify where to source candidates.

## Practice Assessment

This is a must-do strategy for nearly all recruiters. It dramatically improves the efficiency and effectiveness of recruiters, while also increasing hiring manager satisfaction.

Recruiters cannot make this shift alone. Hiring managers will not voluntarily dedicate more time to this initial conversation, especially if they know it means making tradeoffs between desired candidate qualifications. Senior HR leaders will need to work with senior operational leaders to set the expectation that recruiters and managers communicate in real-time to negotiate must-haves. They should explain that while this will require more of an upfront time investment before the search begins, recruiters will be able to fill positions faster. Over time, as managers and recruiters improve their working relationship and discuss the same roles, these conversations will require less time.

```
HR Advancement Center Grades
Practice Impact: A
Ease of Implementation: A-
```


## (Optional) Component 1: Use Data to Show What Talent Is Available in the Market

The first component of the candidate profile negotiation is for recruiters to share data on what talent is available in their local market, with a special focus on the candidate qualifications the hiring manager requested.

This entails recruiters providing data on the prevalence of requested qualifications. Recruiters can draw on market data or data from a previous applicant pool for a similar position. Next, recruiters estimate how much each additional qualification will lengthen time to fill.

## Using Data to Back Up a Realistic Candidate Profile



## Component 2: Ask Questions to Surface Trade-Offs between Candidate Qualifications

The second component of the candidate profile negotiation is for recruiters to ask hiring managers questions to elicit need-to-have versus nice-tohave qualifications.

At Virtua, recruiters use the questions shown here to ensure they start the search with a realistic candidate profile. These questions include: What differentiates an average performer from an exceptional one? How is performance measured? These questions help the recruiter understand what is actually expected in the role, distinguish extraneous qualifications from critical ones, and negotiate need-to-have qualifications with the hiring manager.

## Clarifying Need-to-Have Versus Nice-to-Have at Virtua

## Intake Session Discussion Guide

1. Recruiter starts conversation by sharing data on talent supply for this role.
2. Questions for hiring manager:

- What are the key traits you're looking for in this person? (In order of priority)
- How is performance measured?
- What does a low performer do in this position?
- What does a high performer do differently from an average performer?
- Any major projects that the candidate may be championing in his/her first year?
- Why would a top talent candidate want to work in this position vs. a competitor?
- How will this position impact the strategic direction of the organization/affect change?
- What is the typical career path for someone coming into this position?


Case in Brief: Virtua Health System

- Three-hospital nonprofit health care system located in southern New Jersey
- Principled intake discussion between hiring manager and Talent Acquisition Consultant identifies specific success criteria for the job, determines the hiring manager's ideal candidate profile, and results in a service level agreement signed by both parties
- All recruiters also receive customer-centric sales training to more easily identify factors most important to candidates that may not be apparent on resumes and prompts hiring managers to highlight Virtua's strong fit with these 'hot buttons' throughout the process


## (Optional) Component 3: Get Manager Feedback on Where to Source Candidates

The third component of candidate profile negotiation is to get manager feedback on where to source candidates.

Recruiters at Providence Health and Services headquartered in Renton, WA reserve time at the end of a negotiation to ask the hiring manager where to source candidates. Recruiters ask hiring managers for input on the best ways to search for the candidate. For instance: are there similar roles or alternative job titles? What membership associations would an ideal candidate belong to? Recruiters then connect with the hiring manager on Linkedln in order to connect with potential candidates in their online network.

## Providence Intake Clarifies Where to Find Candidates

## PROVIDENCE <br> Health \& Services

## Providence Intake Session Discussion Guide

1. Recruiter provides overview of process and timelines, stresses importance of "courting" candidates in the interview, and reviews resumes of quality candidates not selected for the role they applied for and previous applicants that may fit the job description.
2. Questions for hiring manager to help attract and source candidates:

- Please provide 3 questions that would be effective in differentiating a great candidate from a good candidate?
- Have you made staff aware of the opening and asked for referrals?
- I saw you're on Linkedln and I sent you an invitation to connect. May I request introductions to your network if there are individuals whom I believe may be candidates or have referrals? Anyone you don't want me to talk to?
- Are there similar roles or alternative job titles in other organizations or industries that I should search for? Any buzz or key words to look for when reviewing resumes?
- What organizations do you belong to? Can we get a membership directory?
- Any events coming up that we can leverage to advertise, sponsor, or network?

$+$


## Case in Brief: Providence Health and Services

- 34-hospital health system and health plan headquartered in Renton, WA
- Launched major talent acquisition transformation initiative called 'Talent For The Future' in December 2014 to enhance partnerships between HR and hiring managers and create a candidate-centric recruiting experience to attract talent
- Provided recruiters and hiring managers with a toolkit to enhance the recruiting process, isolating five specific opportunities where hiring managers play a crucial role: to develop a candidate profile for open positions, to communicate more effectively, to elevate value of interviews as a promotional tool, to surface and refer strong candidates that were not selected for positions, and to stay engaged with candidates between time of offer and first day of work
- During formal intake for new position requisitions, hiring managers and recruiters partner to build a robust and realistic candidate profile, review where recruiters might surface strong candidates, and discuss any guidance to aid in screening; goal is to improve the quality of candidates referred to hiring managers and increase yield on managers' time

Hiring teams at Virtua and Providence are reaping the benefits of dedicating time to negotiate candidate qualifications. At Providence, over $75 \%$ of hiring managers agreed that the candidates they interviewed met the requirements identified in the intake session. At Virtua, hiring managers rate "quality of hire" 4.6 on a 5 -point scale. These positive results don't necessarily mean that hiring managers are receiving candidates who meet an exhaustive list of qualifications but instead that recruiters are identifying candidates with "must have" qualifications.

## Providence Managers Largely Satisfied with Candidate Quality

Hiring manager response to:
"Did the candidates you interviewed meet the requirements you jointly defined in the intake meeting with your recruiter?" May 2016


Strongly Disagree
Strongly Agree

## Practice 4

## Recruiter Role Immersion

## Practice in Brief

Recruiters dedicate time (beyond established meetings) to meet with managers and staff to gain additional insight into candidates who will be a good fit for certain roles and units. The goal is for recruiters to gain first-hand information about the work environment and needed skills and competencies for specific units and roles rather than wholly relying on electronic communication (emails, requisitions, etc.) to try to elicit the same information.

## Rationale

A growing reliance on technology, coupled with an increasing volume of requisitions, and push towards centralization has made it all too easy for recruiters to become distanced from the units and roles they are recruiting for. As a result, recruiters often only understand the technical qualifications for a role and have less context about what it takes to be a good fit for the team. Recruiters then spend an inordinate amount of time struggling to pinpoint the right candidate for their hiring managers.

## Implementation Options

## Option 1: Informally Round on Unit Managers with Hard-to-Fill Positions

 After beginning the search process, recruiters check-in with department managers where they struggle to find candidates that meet the hiring manager's requirements. The goal is to quickly clarify (and adjust if needed) the desired qualifications.
## Option 2: Meet One-on-One with Hiring Manager

Recruiters schedule a more formal one-on-one meeting with a hiring manager to better understand their candidate preferences, their management style, and team culture. The goal is to surface information that helps the recruiter find stronger candidates and build a stronger working relationship with the hiring manager.

## Option 3: Shadow Employees in the Role

Recruiters shadow employees to observe and ask about what it takes to be successful in their role. The goal is to gain perspective on the unit's culture and dynamics and isolate the specific skills and competencies needed to succeed in the role.

## Practice Assessment

This practice is especially valuable for recruiters who are new to an organization, recruiting for a new role, or building a new relationship with a hiring manager. While these options may initially seem daunting to time-strapped recruiters, the Center firmly believes a little time invested early in the recruiting process will save significantly more time later in the process.

## HR Advancement Center Grades

Practice Impact: B+
Ease of Implementation: B

## Option 1: Informally Round on Unit Managers with Hard-toFill Positions

The first option to help recruiters gain additional insight into the roles they are filling (and candidates they are recommending) is to informally round on units with hard-to-fill positions. Recruiters conduct brief, informal rounds to checkin with the hiring manager to determine if they are sharing appropriate candidates. These informal rounds are best held after recruiters have already had their initial meeting with the hiring manager and they've recommended a few candidates. The goal is to proactively troubleshoot and redirect their search if needed.

We recommend recruiters meet with only a handful of hiring managers each week. Recruiters should prioritize meeting with managers who oversee units with the three to five hardest-to-fill positions. The conversation should last only about 15 minutes. Recruiters can use the questions shown here to diagnose any underlying issues and revise their game plan if needed.

## Rounding on "Hot Spots" to Refine the Search

## Recruiter Rounding Template

```
Leader Name:
Rounding Location:
Date:
Things to keep in mind:
- Choose a time to round where hiring manager will be . Let hiring manager know you are there for a quick
    less occupied
Ask open-ended questions check-in (no more than 15 minutes)
- Ask open-ended questions
- Send a follow-up email to hiring manager with information you discussed
```

| Questions | Notes | Recruiter asks <br> questions to ensure |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Any feedback on candidates <br> that l've sent you or you've <br> interviewed that you feel really <br> good about? |  | quey are on the right <br> the <br> track with recent <br> candidate referred to <br> hiring manager |
| Any feedback on candidates <br> that you were not impressed <br> with? |  | Recruiter and hiring <br> manager determine if |
| Should we change any of the <br> qualifications to broaden or <br> narrow the search? | they should adjust <br> the candidate profile <br> moving forward |  |
| Any recommended <br> organizations or resources I <br> should leverage to find more <br> qualified candidates? <br> Any employees I should reach <br> out to for referrals who are well <br> connected? |  |  |
| Optional: "As part of our pay it <br> forward program, [your <br> colleague] said you might like <br> lexplain candidate] who <br> interviewed for their position..." |  |  |

## Option 2: Meet One-on-One with Hiring Manager

The second option to help recruiters gain additional insight into the roles they are filling (and candidates they are recommending) is to meet one-on-one with a hiring manager to understand more about their team culture and leadership style. The goal is for the recruiter to find stronger candidates and build a stronger relationship with the hiring manager.

Recruiting leaders at UPMC encourage recruiters who are new to a hiring manager to spend an hour building a personal relationship with the manager. UPMC's recruiters initially ask a few questions to break the ice and develop a rapport, then they ask a few questions to get a sense for what the hiring manager looks for in candidates. The template shown here is adapted from the one that UPMC uses.

## Getting to Know Hiring Managers at UPMC

## One-on-One Manager Meeting

## Leader Name:

Department:
Date:

| Discussion Points | Notes |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Introductions <br> - Start the conversation by sharing your background, tenure and experience. Let the manager know that you are a part of their team. <br> - Share any relevant recruitment data on key positions in their department <br> - What brought you to [organization]? <br> - What do you enjoy most about your current role? |  | Template ${ }^{1}$ provides discussion points for recruiters to establish a personal connection with the hiring manager and underscore their credibility |
| Ideal Candidate Profile for Each Role <br> - For [role you're recruiting for], when you think about your top performers, what makes them stand out? <br> - What are the five ideal qualifications for this role? What two are your must-haves? |  | Recruiter pinpoints information to help them find the right candidates |
| Team Culture <br> - What are you most proud of about your team/unit? <br> - Why might a person working in this unit not succeed? <br> Hiring Manager Recruiting Skill |  | Recruiter collects information to help them sell candidates on the unit |
| - What are the areas of hiring you feel least equipped to handle? |  |  |

$+$

## Case in Brief: UPMC

- 20-hospital integrated finance and delivery system based in Pittsburgh, including more than 500 outpatient sites, insurance plans with nearly three million members, international ventures, as well as an innovation division focused on the integration of technology within health care
- Recruiters new to the organization or working with a new customer group meet one-on-one with hiring managers and shadow employees to better understand how to screen effectively and sell positions to candidates
- Shadowing ranges from two to four hours; through observation and conversations with team members, recruiters learn about team culture, what it takes to succeed in the role, and what team members enjoy about their work and work environment
- When recruiters meet with hiring managers one-on-one they take a picture with them to share with the recruiting team; after shadowing or the one-on-one with the hiring manager, recruiters debrief the recruitment team during team huddle, discuss what they learned, and generate a plan

Option 3: Shadow Employees in the Role

The third option to help recruiters gain additional insight into the role they are filling (and candidates they are recommending) is to shadow current employees. The goal is for recruiters to gain perspective on the unit's culture and dynamics and isolate the specific skills and competencies needed to succeed in the role.

At UPMC, recruiters who are new to the role or working with new departments may opt to spend three to four hours shadowing current employees. As they shadow, recruiters observe current employees at work and ask questions. Afterwards, they debrief with the hiring manager about what they've learned.

HR leaders can provide recruiters with the template shown here to ensure they're learning the most from their shadowing experience.

UPMC is performing well below national benchmarks for nurse time-to-fill and vacancy rates. Part of their strong performance is due to their efforts to ensure recruiters have a deeper understanding of the skills and competencies required to succeed in the roles they are filling.

## A Behind-the-Scenes View of Critical Roles at UPMC

## Job Shadowing




Guiding questions ${ }^{1}$ to pinpoint drivers of long-term success in the role

- What are the primary responsibilities of this role?
- For the people who stand out to you as leaders on the unit, what are they doing differently?
- What does the pace of the job feel like?
- How would you describe the team culture?

Questions for Team

- Why do you like working in this department?
- What is the most satisfying part of your role?
- If you were trying to convince a friend to work here, what would you tell them?
- Once you started in this role, what was the most surprising part of your job?
(Optional) Debrief with Hiring Manager $\quad$ Notes

Share some of your takeaways from the shadowing. Share what you are impressed with.

- From my understanding, the daily expectations of this role are [insert what you've observed from the shadowing], is there anything that l'm



## UPMC Time to Fill and Vacancy Well Below Benchmark

Bedside Nurse Time to Fill, Days
2015

52


Bedside Nurse Vacancy Rate, Requisitions

2015


A recap of the three options to help recruiters gain additional insight into the role they are filling (and candidates they are recommending) is shown here.

As you read from left to right, each option requires progressively more of a recruiter's time. Additional key considerations are listed under each option. While each option is a recommended way to help recruiters gain insight into roles they are filling, keep in mind these are all intended to supplement Practice 3: Candidate Profile Negotiation. Recruiters should always begin the recruiting process with a conversation with the hiring manager to clarify must-have qualifications. If the recruiter still feels they don't have a good understanding of what they are looking for after this initial conversation, then they can use the options shown here. All options are an additional time investment. Therefore, recruiters should prioritize these practices for their hardest-to-fill roles.

## Weighing Options for Recruiters to Gain Expertise



## Recruiter

Rounding
15 minutes/leader

- Recruiter currently recruiting for a vacant role?
- Manager not providing feedback or unsatisfied with current candidates?


One-on-One Manager Meeting
60 minutes/leader

- New relationship with hiring manager?
- Severed relationship?
- Atypically hard-to-fill role where you need more guidance than usual?



## Job Shadowing

3-4 hours/unit

- Recruiter that's new to the organization?
- Recruiter working for a new unit?
- New(er) role at the organization?


## Practice 5

## Pre-hire Screens

## Practice in Brief

Talent acquisition leaders determine if their organization can benefit from leveraging a screening tool to assess candidate fit. The goal is to send hiring managers fewer, higher quality candidates.

## Rationale

Recruiter and hiring manager screening and interviewing are inherently subject to human error. Interviewers often overlook great candidates or hire bad ones. Screening tools offer a data-driven approach that may be less subject to human error.

## Implementation Component

## Component 1: Consider Six Key Factors When Deciding on a Screening Tool

HR leaders should answer six key questions to identify how they could best benefit from a screening tool. With that answer in mind, they should then select the appropriate vendor.

## Practice Assessment

Use of candidate screening software is still sufficiently new that there isn't a clear industry-wide standard on if (or how) to use them. Use our six factors to inform your decision about whether your organization would benefit from candidate screening software.

## HR Advancement Center Grades

Practice Impact: B+
Ease of Implementation: B-

## Component 1: Consider Six Key Factors When Deciding on a Screening Tool

The six key considerations shown here and the corresponding vendor guide can help HR leaders determine if a vendor-and if so, which onewill meet their organization's screening needs.

The first four questions focus on the intent of the screening tool. If you are considering using a screening tool, it is important to define the intent and decide in advance how to apply the results. Organizations can use screening results as an automatic "knock out." Or screening results can be used as one data point in the larger hiring decision. For instance, recruiters and hiring managers could ask follow-up questions to investigate the candidate's lowscoring areas. Regardless of your choice, the screening tool must be applied consistently across your organization.

The last two questions focus on your desired level of customization. Use your answers to help inform your assessment of the vendors listed on the following page.

## Key Considerations for Candidate Screening Vendors

## Key Questions \& Decision Points <br> Implications for Screening Software

1. What is the population you want to screen?

- Are you narrowing down a large pool of candidates?
- Are you choosing between a few top candidates?

2. What is your hiring team's screening strengths?

- Are recruiters and hiring managers good at screening for job fit but not culture fit?
- Are they good at screening for culture fit but not job fit?

3. When do you want candidates to complete the assessment?

- Will candidates complete the assessment when they've already been selected for a final interview?
- Will candidates complete the assessment as part of their initial application?

4. How will managers and recruiters to use the screening software?

- Will this assessment be a black and white cutoff?
- Will the assessment be open to interpretation by your hiring team?

5. How much do you want to shape the screen?

- Will your leaders want to help shape the assessment?
- Do you need to add specific questions tailored to your organization?

6. What bar will you use to judge candidate fit?

- Do you want to benchmark against your own organization's top performers?
- Do you want to benchmark against a national benchmark?


## Pricing Structure

- Look for vendors with a global fee for unlimited use
- Price-per-report may be feasible

See Key Consideration \#5 in the vendor assessment guide (p.43)

## Type of screen

- Screen for values or culture fit
- Screen for job fit, skill fit

See Key Consideration \#1 in the vendor assessment guide

## Length and Complexity of Screen

- Assessment can be longer, more complex
- Assessment should be shorter to avoid drop-off in application

See Key Consideration \#3 in the vendor assessment guide

## Data Provided from Report

- Need at minimum final scores (pass/fail)
- Want a more comprehensive report on the candidate

See Key Consideration \#4 in the vendor assessment guide

## Customization

- Need customizable assessment
- Can have off-the shelf assessment


## Consult potential vendors

## Benchmarking

- Vendor that can build screen from own organization's data
- Vendor with a large database of national benchmarks

Consult potential vendors

The Candidate Assessment Vendor Guide provides an overview of the major screening vendors in 2016. It includes the four vendors who received 2015/2016 Best in Klas Awards for Software and Services in Talent Management from the vendor research firm, Klas. This guide provides an overview of: user experience, pricing structure, product differentiation, and health care organizations that use the product.

Candidate Assessment Vendor Guide available at advisory.com/ hrac/wintalent

## Quick Glance at the Screening Vendor Marketplace



## Practice 6

## Runner-Up Hiring

## Practice in Brief

Strong candidates who do not receive an offer for the position they applied to are automatically considered for other appropriate positions. The goal is to stretch a limited candidate pool by retaining as many strong candidates as possible.

## Rationale

When it's time to start a new candidate search, all too often recruiters start from scratch instead of taking advantage of a short list of candidates who were a great fit-but weren't hired for the position they applied for originally. These candidates are already qualified, vetted, and interested in the organization. And they can be an easy win for the recruiter and hiring manager.

## Implementation Components

## Component 1: Capture the Runners-Up

Talent acquisition leaders determine the right moment in the recruiting process to identify runner-up hires-either after the initial candidate screen or the final interview.

Component 2: Pinpoint the Right Alternate Opportunity for the Runner-Up
Recruiters consult the hiring manager who initially interviewed the candidate and other recruiters to find appropriate alternate opportunities.

## Component 3: Communicate the Opportunity to the Runner-Up

 Recruiters follow up with runner-up candidates as early as possible to discuss alternate opportunities.
## Practice Assessment

Hiring runner-up candidates is a no-regrets move. While some recruiters may already share "runner-up candidates" with other recruiters on a one-off basis, standardizing a process for re-routing these candidates can save recruitment teams significant time and resources.

## HR Advancement Center Grades

Practice Impact: A
Ease of Implementation: B

## Component 1: Capture the Runners-Up

Recruiters have two opportunities to identify runnerup candidates (a candidate who is a good fit for the organization, but may not get the job they applied for originally). The first opportunity happens before the candidate's final interview.
Recruiters at Virtua flag candidates who seem to be a strong fit for the organization even before the candidate interviews with the hiring manager. Then, if the candidate isn't extended an offer, recruiters can prioritize finding a position for them elsewhere.

The second opportunity for identifying runner-up candidates occurs after the candidates' final interview with the hiring manager. Recruiters at Providence debrief with the hiring manager after the final round of interviews to identify potential runner-up candidates.

## Make Second Place a Winner in Another Race

Two Moments to Identify the Runner-Up Candidate
$\qquad$

## Before the Final Interview

Recruiter uses candidate screening results-recruiter's assessment or a pre-hire assessment-to determine whether they are a good fit for the organization, even if not a strong fit for current role

## After the Final Interview

Recruiter debriefs with hiring manager after final interview to determine which candidates who weren't selected for the role may be a better fit elsewhere

## Component 2: Pinpoint the Right Alternate Opportunity for the Runner-Up

The second component of this practice is for recruiters to find the right alternate opportunity for the runner-up candidate. Recruiters have two experts they can consult to find the right opportunity: the hiring manager who initially interviewed the candidate and their fellow recruiters.

At Providence, when recruiters debrief with the hiring manager after final interviews, they ask the hiring manager which candidates are strong "runners up." Recruiters tag these candidates in their applicant tracking system with a special designation that allows other recruiters to search for runnersup to fill their open positions. In addition to tagging runners-up in the ATS, the Center recommends that runner-up candidates become a standing agenda item at recruitment team meetings so that recruiters can discuss them live and better match candidates to positions.

## To Find the Right Fit Start by Asking the Experts

## 至 <br> Get Recommendation from Hiring Manager

What colleagues do you think would be excited about this candidate? Can I let them know that the candidate has your stamp of approval?"

```
O-%
Encourage Candidate Sharing Among Recruiters
Is anyone looking for a candidate that is strong in [strengths] and has [experience]. [Hiring manager] loved them but went with another applicant."
```


## Providence Health System

- 34-hospital health system and health plan headquartered in Renton, WA
- As part of HR transformation initiative, launched the 'Silver Medalist' program to re-route candidates who demonstrated strong fit but were not selected by the hiring manager to other openings in the organization
- Recruiters flag silver-medalists in the applicant tracking system, and can filter for these candidates

Another way to match runnersup to open positions is with software. Pegged software-a screening tool used in some health care organizations-uses algorithms to predict job fit.

As shown below, a hospital in the Northeast used Pegged to match past applicants to currently open hard-to-fill roles.

## Harnessing Big Data to Assess Job Fit Across Roles

## 3 <br> Predict Success

- Pegged runs candidates' data through algorithm and predicts their impact on the pre-selected outcome
- Pegged correlates candidate's data with employee data for all jobs and predicts candidate's job fit for roles across the organization

Pegged runner-up recommendations for a 7,500-employee health system

Home Care RN
Initial Applicants Department RN

18
Maternal Child Department RN

20

## Applicants recommended

 by Pegged based on potential to succeed
## Technology in Brief: Pegged Software

- "Big data" analytics engine founded in 2009 in Baltimore, Maryland, deployed in over 400 health care organizations, processing three million job applications annually
- Candidates complete a 20 minute automated fit screen; Pegged collects data both related to the substance of candidate answers and behaviors analyzed while completing the screen (i.e. giving up on hard question, typing longer answers, delays before responding, tendency to make bold statements) along with application data, background and other data
- Unique algorithms predict a candidate's potential impact on a metric(s) of the client's choosing (i.e. patient satisfaction and safety)
- Across 94 clients with sufficient experience for analysis, Pegged analytics reduced overall turnover by an average of $38 \%$ and reduced first year turnover by an average of $75 \%$ (median reduction of $22 \%$ )


## Component 3: Communicate the Opportunity to the Runner-Up

The final component of runnerup hiring is to share the new, alternate opportunity with the runner-up candidate. The recruiter should call the candidate to discuss the opportunity and should position the new opportunity as a positive development.

At Providence, recruiters always share new opportunities with runner-up candidates through a phone call—never via email. Recruiters carefully craft their message to ensure the runnerup feels valued, even though they weren't offered the position they initially were interested in.

## Positive Delivery Gets Candidates Excited

## Recruiter's Script for the Runner-Up

Hello Nancy!
This is Judy from Phoebe Health's recruitment team. How are you?
I am calling in follow-up to your interview yesterday with Sarah in our Development office. Unfortunately, the ${ }^{*}$ Manager of Annual Giving position has been offered to someone else who had more years of leadership experience. I'm sorry that you didn't get the position that you wanted, it was a tough decision for Sarah.
With that said, Sarah really enjoyed her interview with you and was impressed by your extensive financial background. She and I both felt that you'd be a great fit for the organization, and we don't want to lose you!
If you are open to discussing the opportunity, I spoke with Carrie Jean, our Director for Corporate Social $\quad$ Responsibility, about an opportunity as a Manager of Community Impact where you'd be overseeing our corporation's giving. We thought this might be a great fit for your skill set. Would you be open to this opportunity?

Provide an explanation of why they didn't get the job

Compliment them on their skill set and the hiring manager's impression of them

Recommend an alternate opportunity, ideally that you've already looked into

Providence's
Scripting for Runner-
Up Candidates available at advisory.com/ hrac/wintalent

## - Prepare Hiring Managers to Close the Deal Fast

Practice 7: Fast-Track Interviews
Practice 8: Interviewer's Cheat Sheet
Practice 9: Same-Day Offers

The third must-do strategy for updating your recruiting playbook is to equip your hiring managers to quickly "close the deal" with top candidates. This means HR staff need to help hiring managers make timely hiring decisions and sell candidates on the organization, not just screen them. Managers need help because they often don't have time to extensively prepare for candidate interviews and have never been trained on how to "sell" candidates.

Answer the questions here to determine how much opportunity your hiring managers have to improve their ability to close the deal fast. Each "no" answer indicates room for improvement; two or more 'no' answers indicates there is opportunity to prepare hiring managers to win top candidates.

The three best practices in this section will help ensure that the hand off from recruiter to hiring manager is smooth and that the hiring manager is prepared to win the candidate before they're given an offer from the competition.

## A Critical Moment in Time Losing Candidates Between Recruiter Screen and Offer



Two Barriers


Manager Workload
Managers have too many tasks to prioritize recruiting and become a bottleneck in the hiring process


## To the Finish Line: Slow Crawl or Efficient Sprint?

## Red Flag Audit for Your Managers' Ability to Close the Deal Fast

Can recruiters schedule final interviews directly with managers, or at minimum know in advance when they can bring a candidate in?
$\square$ Can recruiters provide an offer on the day after a final interview for your most competitive positions?Do hiring managers walk into each interview with a plan of attack to start to close the deal?Do hiring managers have more information about the candidate than what's on the resume?Are you winning the majority of the candidates that you want?

## Practice 7

## Fast-Track Interviews

## Practice in Brief

Recruiters proactively hold time on hiring managers' calendars for candidate interviews. The goal is to ensure recruiters can quickly and efficiently schedule top candidates for their final interview.

## Rationale

Because managers' schedules are often booked well in advance, recruiters can struggle to quickly schedule final interviews. This means strong candidates are lost because managers couldn't interview them in time.

## Implementation Components

## Single Open Position to Fill

## Option 1: Calendar Access

Recruiters have direct access to hiring managers' calendars and schedule interviews with candidates as needed.

## Option 2: Recurring Interview Slots

Recruiters and hiring managers agree upon a recurring time that is reserved exclusively for candidate interviews. As needed, recruiters schedule candidate interviews during those times.

## Multiple Open Positions to Fill

## Option 3: Hiring Blitz

Recruiters reserve several hours on a single day on hiring managers' calendars to interview candidates. During the interview block, hiring managers use a standard one-on-one interviewing format but see multiple candidates. To attract sufficient candidates to make this efficient, we recommend recruiters host an open-house for a large group of candidates who have all applied for the same type of position.

## Option 4: Group Rotating Interview

Recruiters reserve no more than two hours on a single day on hiring managers' calendars. During the interview block all candidates and managers are present in the same room, and candidates rotate between all the hiring managers in a "speed dating" format. Hiring managers make joint hiring decisions after the interview.

## Practice Assessment

Before this practice can be introduced (and sustained), recruiters will need to prove they can consistently identify candidates who meet hiring managers' expectations. To that end, The Center recommends ensuring Practice \#3 Candidate Profile Negotiation is consistently executed before introducing this practice.

## HR Advancement Center Grades

## Practice Impact: A-

Ease of Implementation: C+

Organizations have four primary options to ensure candidates have timely interviews with hiring managers. All options are equally effective. You should choose the options that will face the least resistance at your organization and that best meet your organization's hiring needs. The decision tree shown here will help you identify which option may be the best fit. Keep in mind that you don't have to have a single option across your organization-it will likely vary by manager and role. The following pages provide more detail on the least known option for fast-track interviewing: group rotating interview.

## Weighing the Options for Fast-Track Interviews



## Option 4: Group Rotating Interview

While it is often less well-known, the group rotating interview is an effective option for quickly scheduling interviews with multiple candidates. Recruiters reserve no more than two hours on a single day on hiring managers' calendars. During each hour-long interview block, recruiters bring an equal number of managers and candidates into a room to avoid having a candidate "sit out" a round. The interview follows a "speed dating" format. Each manager asks a candidate a single question before the candidates rotate to the next hiring manager. Hiring managers make joint hiring decisions after the interview. Consider having an "on call" interviewer to fill-in for any last minute no-shows.

Mosaic Life Care based in St. Joseph, Missouri piloted this group interviewing process when the system expanded and needed to fill several nursing roles quickly. Mosaic recruiters opened each session with an icebreaker to give candidates a chance to get to know each other and the hiring managers. Candidates spoke with multiple hiring managers over the course of the hour, with each hiring manager asking a single question. Afterwards, managers huddled to decide who to hire. If two hiring managers wanted to hire the same candidate, they both extended an offer, and the candidate decided which to accept.

## Maximizing Hiring Manager Interview Efficiency

## Group Rotating Interviewing Process at Mosaic Life Care






At the end of the hour, managers huddle and collectively decide which candidates to hire

## Case in Brief: Mosaic Life Care

- 310-bed single hospital health system headquartered in St. Joseph, Missouri
- Implemented 'Speed Dating' interview format when they were undergoing a rapid expansion and needed to rapidly fill many new roles
- Six hiring managers interview six candidates within an hour, each hiring manager has one question to ask and spends 6-8 minutes with each candidate in the room


## Practice 8

## Interviewer's Cheat Sheet

## Practice in Brief

Recruiters identify what will make a role and organization attractive to a candidate, and then provide hiring managers with talking points that will help them sell their open position.

## Rationale

Hiring managers have limited experience on how to sell their open position and unit; most spend the majority of their interview time grilling the candidate. If recruiters tell hiring managers exactly what's important to the candidate, and how to speak to the candidate's priorities, hiring managers will be better prepared to win candidates.

## Implementation Components

Component 1: Identify What Will Make a Role Attractive to the Candidate in the Initial Screen During the initial screen, recruiters elicit what is most important to the candidate when he/she is evaluating job opportunities.

Component 2: Give the Hiring Manager(s) Guidance on How to Appeal to the Candidate Recruiters give the hiring manager specific guidance on what the candidate is looking for and how to best position their unit and open position in the final interview.

## Practice Assessment

This practice is a highly effective strategy to help hiring managers recruit candidates during the interview. This practice doesn't require a large change in workflow. Recruiters often already collect the necessary information during their initial interview, but they do not often share it with managers in an easy-to-use format. This practice will help recruiters efficiently share key information with managers. It is recommended for all recruiters-especially those focused on hard-to-fill positions.

## HR Advancement Center Grades

Practice Impact: A
Ease of Implementation: A-

## Component 1: Identify What Will Make a Role Attractive to the Candidate in the Initial Screen

The first component of this practice is for a recruiter to identify what will make a role attractive to a candidate.

Recruiters at Providence listen for a candidate's "hot buttons" in the initial phone screen. They use this form with a list of common hot buttons-including: shorter commute, relationship with family, stretch assignments-to help them identify these hot buttons during the initial call. These hot buttons tell the recruiter and the hiring manager what to emphasize as they sell the candidate on the open position and organization.

## Uncovering Candidates' Motivators at Providence

## Providence's Candidate Motivator Form

| TalentAcquisition |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| Understand |  |
| Candidate Motivators |  |
| PURPOSE: Use as a guide to gather and assess candidate motivators during the recruiter prescreen process. <br> GOAL: Insert motivators into your prescreen/prebrief notes to the Hiring Manager for them to use during the interview to "COURT THE CANDIDATE." (See simplified version on page 2 to use for insertion into your notes). |  |
| Candidate Name: $\qquad$ <br> Job Title: $\qquad$ | Date: |
| Check all motivators that apply. List top motivators on prebrief notes to the Hiring Manager. |  |
| Candidate is Interested in: |  |
| Professional Growth | Contributing to organizational mission |
| Promotion / Advancement | Reputation of organization |
| Stretch Assignments | Developing New Skills |
| Work environment \& culture | Project Work |
| Relocation | Increase or Decrease in Hours / FTE |
| Location: | Second job or per diem work |
| Working remotely | Reasons related to family |
| Team dynamics | Relationship with Manager |
| Shorter Commute | Work / Life Balance |
| Scheduling flexibility Specify: | Benefits: Specify: |
| Education \& Training Specify: | Certification(s): Specify: |
| Other: | Other: |
| 1 \| Copyright 2016 Providence Health \& Services |  |

## Case in Brief: Providence Health and Services

- 34-hospital health system and health plan headquartered in Renton, Washington
- As part of larger talent acquisition transformation, recruiters use the candidate motivator form to isolate motivators that may not be apparent from resume review
- Recruiters share candidate motivators with hiring managers
- Hiring managers use motivators in their interview and any other communications with candidates, and select peer interviewers whose interests align with the candidate's motivators


## Component 2: Give the Hiring Manager(s) Guidance on How to Appeal to the Candidate

The second component of this practice is for recruiters to give hiring managers specific guidance on how to most effectively recruit the candidate based on their hot buttons. This can be done through a simple cheat-sheet.

We recommend using a cheat sheet like the one shown here. It is designed to be simple for the recuiter and hiring manager to use. Recruiters jot notes on a candidate's hot buttons, and the middle column provides the hiring manager with tips on how to use the information. The far right column is left blank so hiring managers can write notes before the interview, if they like.

The cheat sheet shown here is inspired by one Virtua's recruiters give to hiring managers before a final candidate interview.

Interviewer's Cheat Sheet available at advisory.com/ hrac/wintalent

## Tilt the Scales in Our Favor

Candidate Hot Button Profile (Excerpt)
Name: Judy Olsen
Years of Experience: 7
Previous Role: Charge Nurse, ICU

| Recruiter Notes | Manager Tip | (Optional) Manager Notes |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1. What is the candidate <br> most proud of? <br> Received employee of the <br> month award last month | Start the conversation <br> with their <br> accomplishments. <br> Give the candidate a <br> compliment. | I know that you recently <br> won the employee of the <br> month award. <br> Congratulations! I'd love to <br> hear more about it. |
| 2. Why are they a good <br> candidate for your <br> team? <br> Has many years of <br> experience as a charge <br> nurse and has trained <br> inexperienced ICU nurses | Use this information <br> to talk about why they <br> are such a good fit for <br> your team. | I really value your years of <br> experience as an ICU <br> nurse. You would be a <br> great addition to our <br> team. It sounds like you <br> also have some experience <br> training less experienced |
| nurses? |  |  |$\quad$| I see (based on home |
| :--- |
| address) that you live |

You can also use video interviewing technology to give hiring managers better information about a candidate before the final interview. When hiring managers have the option to watch a candidate's prerecorded interview before they come in, they can get to know the candidate and think through how to most effectively recruit them. This frees up the manager from relying solely on a recruiter's notes.

At Providence, clarifying the candidate's hot buttons and teaching hiring managers how to more effectively recruit candidates has positively impacted candidates' interview experience. When asked in a post-interview survey: "Were you able to form a meaningful connection through the interview process?" 17 out of 18 candidates gave a 9 or 10 (on a scale from 1-10).

## Using Video to Give Managers a Sneak Peek



Video Interviewing offers a secure, convenient option for candidates to interview for roles. Option is especially valuable for:

- High-availability roles
- Executive and leadership roles
- Candidates who are not local


## Multiple Benefits of <br> Video Interviewing

Asynchronous: Candidates can record a video that can be reviewed at any time by the hiring team


Two Takes: Candidates have the option to re-record their answers for the perfect shot

Hiring Manager Input: Hiring managers see more than a resume and so are more prepared for the final interview. Recruiters can win hiring managers' approval in advance
"The vast majority of hiring managers really like [video interviewing]. They can sit down for an hour, on their own time, and see ten candidates and decide which of those ten candidates they really like instead of scheduling ten interviews."

Senior Director, Recruitment and Sourcing Academic Medical Center in Midwest

## Candidates Report a Meaningful Connection at Providence

Candidate response to:
"Were you able to form a meaningful connection through the interview process?"
May 2016


Practice 9

## Same-Day Offers

## Practice in Brief

Recruiters and managers collaborate to extend same-day offers to strong, pre-screened candidates.

## Rationale

Recruiters must extend offers to top candidates quickly if they don't want to lose them to the competition. In an effort to speed up the recruiting process, some organizations try full-cycle sameday hiring. This entails completing all elements of the hiring process (from the initial screening interview to final offer) in one day. Many organizations find this logistically overwhelming and risky.

Same-day offers are a more feasible way to speed up the hiring process, without having to commit to completing the full recruiting cycle in a single day.

## Implementation Components

## Component 1: Schedule a Hiring Event and Front-load Screening of Event Attendees

Recruiters vet candidates prior to the hiring event (e.g., application and licensure verification) so that hiring managers are prepared to make contingent offers on the same day.

## Component 2: Prepare Hiring Managers to Rapidly Assess Candidates to Enable Same-Day Contingent Offers

Recruiters prepare hiring managers with key information about each candidate before the interview. Recruiters ensure additional staff are available to network with candidates to provide time for recruiters and managers to make hiring decisions.

## Practice Assessment

Many organizations are already extending same-day offers for high-turnover roles, and we recommend extending same-day offers to hard-to-fill roles as well.

Same-day offers are often most efficient when they are one component of a large-scale hiring event. To make the event worthwhile, your recruiting team will need to make a small investment in advertising so that a large number of candidates attend. To minimize the advertising cost, tap into your employees' and hiring managers' networks and publicize through your community partners. Recruiters will also have to prepare hiring managers to make expedited hiring decisions. This means they should thoroughly screen candidates in advance, equip hiring managers with key candidate information, and debrief with hiring managers on the day of the event.

## HR Advancement Center Grades <br> Practice Impact: A- <br> Ease of Implementation: C+

## Component 1: Schedule a Hiring Event and Front-Ioad Screening of Event Attendees

The first component of this practice is to organize a large-scale hiring event and frontload elements of the candidate screening so that hiring managers and recruiters can extend contingent same-day offers.

MacNeal Hospital in Berwyn, IL hosts large-scale hiring events for roles with high-cost vacancies such as nursing, physical therapy (PT) and occupational therapy (OT). At MacNeal, event attendees register in advance. ${ }^{1}$ In addition to the typical candidate screen, recruiters also complete a candidate's licensure verification and have the candidate complete their online application before the hiring event.

## Staging Same-Day Hiring at MacNeal

## Steps Completed Before the Hiring Event

HR advertises role-specific hiring event through email blasts, website, and career page


Candidates pre-register for event


HR screens candidates and verifies licenses


HR forwards resumes to managers to prepare them for interviews

## Case in Brief: MacNeal Hospital

- 427-bed teaching hospital located in Berwyn, IL
- Instituted same-day hiring four years ago when hiring managers facing high vacancies expressed need for urgency to quickly fill roles. Largescale hiring events target OT, PT and nursing roles
- Candidates pre-register, and recruiters frontload screening and license verification and send promising resumes to hiring managers
- 10-14 hiring nurse managers attend event and interview candidates; Top-prospects go on tour of unit; Managers extend some offers same-day and HR follows up with written offer the next day
- Most recent event for nursing was attended by 65 candidates and resulted in 17 total hires, 5 of which were same-day; same-day hiring events shorten hiring process by estimated 30 days


## Component 2: Prepare Hiring Managers to Rapidly Assess Candidates to Enable Same-Day Contingent Offers

The third component of this practice is to schedule and prepare hiring managers to rapidly assess candidates so that they can make contingent, same-day offers.

Recruiters at MacNeal prepare for same-day nurse hiring events by proactively holding time for candidate interviews with relevant nurse managers. Nurse managers also proactively notify nurses on their unit so they are prepared to lead unit tours for top candidates. Before the same-day hiring event, recruiters send hiring managers resumes from registered attendees. On the day of the event, recruiters and employees network with candidates who are waiting for their interview. When the hiring manager interviews a candidate they like, a recruiter will escort that candidate to the unit so that employees can give them a tour. While the candidate is on the tour, the hiring manager and recruiter debrief and make a hiring decision.

Same-day offers and large-scale hiring events helped MacNeal's recruiters reduce time-to-hire by 30 days for in-demand candidates.

Additionally, these events help MacNeal recruiters fill a significant number of positions.
During a nursing event in the spring of 2016, 17 attendees were hired and five were extended same-day offers.

# All Hands on Deck for Same-Day Nurse Hiring Events 

## During the Event



Hiring managers interview attendees on the spot

Candidates tour unit while recruiters and hiring managers debrief to make final hiring decisions

Hiring managers verbally extend offers to candidates

## After the Event

HR follows up the next day with a
written offer

## Reducing Time-to-Fill for Costly, Hard-to Fill Positions at MacNeal

## Sizable Reduction in Time to Hire for

 Candidates Attending Hiring Event$$
30 \text { days } \begin{aligned}
& \text { Estimated time same- } \\
& \text { day process shortens } \\
& \text { regular hiring process }
\end{aligned}
$$

Hiring Outcomes from Recent Nurse Hiring Event

## 26\%

Percentage of attendees hired

## 30\%

Percentage of hired attendees who received a same-day offer

# - Court Passive Talent for Future Employment 

Practice 10: No-Strings Professional Development
Practice 11: Employee Referral Program
Practice 12: Under-Tapped Candidate Pools

The fourth and final strategy to build your new recruiting playbook is to cultivate passive talent for future employment. As the labor market becomes more competitive, recruitment teams will have to engage talent that is already employed. This means recruitment leaders have to understand how they can appeal to talent that is not actively seeking employment.

We recommend prioritizing the first three strategies in this publication before tackling this strategy. This is a longer-term effort that will help you identify more candidates. However, if your recruitment process isn't candidate-centric you may not be able to capture many of them.

Not all passive jobseekers have the same level of interest in your organization. We recommend thinking of passive jobseekers as three distinct groups shown on this thermometer. You will need a different strategy to engage each.

The candidates at the bottom of the thermometer have the least interest in your organization. They do not believe there are job opportunities available to them at your organization (often because they have been historically overlooked). The candidates at the top of the thermometer are the most interested in your organization but need the right invitation to engage.

The three best practices in this section will help you cultivate each group of passive candidates.

## "The Talent Doesn't Exist"

## 66

## Every Candidate Is a Passive Candidate

"There is no such thing as a passive candidate anymore. Everyone is a passive candidate. Everyone is employed somewhere. They're all passive until they are active. And then they're active with everyone. Everyone's competing for the same people. Everything we do is aimed at recruiting the passive candidate."

Senior Director, Talent Acquisition Providence Health

Helping Candidates Warm to Us


Source: HR Advancement Center interviews and analysis.

# No-Strings Professional Development 

## Practice in Brief

HR hosts free professional development events that appeal to in-demand candidates. The goal is to offer passive candidates a low-stakes but enticing point of entry to your organization that leaves a positive impression.

## Rationale

Candidates who are already employed may be open to discussing new opportunities but often won't proactively reach out to speak to a recruiter. Professional development events are an effective way to connect with candidates who are currently employed elsewhere.

## Implementation Component

## Component 1: Identify Learning Opportunities That Will Attract Your Target Audience

Recruiters determine which professional development opportunities would be most appealing to those currently employed in high-demand roles. HR leaders then ask internal experts to teach these courses.

## Practice Assessment

This practice is an effective strategy for engaging passive candidates who are not actively looking for a job but may be open to learning and networking opportunities. There is a high likelihood that your organization has existing events that you can open to the public. Consider how you can market these events to attract a wider audience.

It is critical that recruiters remember that this is not a career fair-and shouldn't feel like one to attendees. Lead with professional development and allow the value of the session and the presenters to win over potential candidates.

## HR Advancement Center Grades

Practice Impact: B+
Ease of Implementation: B

## Component 1: Identify Learning Opportunities That Will Attract Your Target Audience

The first component of this practice is to identify learning opportunities that will appeal to your target audience. Then provide these learning opportunities at no-cost to your community.

At UPMC, the recruitment team partners with leaders in the organization to offer professional development sessions to community members. These professional development sessions are tailored to the three groups shown here: students, entrylevel staff, and professionals. Recruiters tailor each event to each audience. For example, students learn about different career options, while professionals network and polish their craft.

At UPMC, each professional development session runs for approximately three to four hours. Participants register in advance and express their areas of interest. Recruiters cast a wide net and publicize these events to all of their community partners, including: Goodwill, The Veteran's Leaders Program, National Black MBA, and the Association of Latino Professionals for America.

## Opening Up Professional Development at UPMC

## Target <br> Audience

Frequency

## Typical Programming



## Student All-Access Day

College and graduate students with either business or clinical backgrounds

Once/month

- Facilities tour
- Panel discussion of UPMC employees in student's field of interest
- Application guidance



## Entry-Level All-Access Day

Support service roles, including EVS, dietary and housekeeping

Once/month

- UPMC overview
- Soft skills and interviewing
- Mock interviewing


Professional All-Access Day
Clinical and business roles

Four times/year

- Featured presentation by UPMC leader (e.g., project management)
- Networking


## $+$

## Case in Brief: UPMC

- 20-hospital integrated finance and delivery system based in Pittsburgh including more than 500 outpatient sites, insurance plans with nearly three million members, international ventures, as well as an innovation division focused on the integration of technology within health care
- Offer skills-oriented All Access Day events targeting distinct talent groups: college students, professionals, and service professionals; sessions run two to three hours
- Sessions for students and entry-level roles focus on interviewing skills; professional sessions focus on networking and presentations (e.g., on project management) led by UPMC leaders
- Classes are advertised through social media and over 100 community partners; attendees RSVP for the event
- As of April 2016, 20 individuals attended professional All Access Day, $75 \%$ of whom then applied to UPMC; 40 individuals have attended the entry-level All Access Day events YTD, 50\% have applied to UPMC

This is an example of how UPMC advertises professional development events for professionals. This event was designed to appeal to project management professionals, with a focus on how to apply project management skills to health care. The advertisement focuses on content, networking, and UPMC experts. It intentionally does not include mention of current opportunities. Additionally, the event is held after work hours or on the weekend to accommodate work schedules and to make it easier for currently employed professionals to attend.

Selling Your Organization Through Quality Presentation


UPMC ALL ACCESS DAY
Saturday, March 12
10 a.m. to noon Downtown Pittsburgh
How do successful people use project management in their work? Join us for a li breakfast as two of UPMC's leaders discuss how they utilize it and share insight o their careers.


UPMC's "no strings attached" professional development events are helping attract passive candidates. The four winter/spring 2016 professional development days tailored to entry-level staff inspired over $50 \%$ of attendees to apply to UPMC—and approximately 30\% of the applicants were hired. A March 2016 professional development day tailored to professionals inspired $75 \%$ of attendees to apply to UPMC.

## Enticing Attendees to Apply

Entry-Level All Access Day



Attendees year to date; four sessions

## 50\%

Attendees who've submitted an application

30\%
Conversion to hire

## Professional All Access Day



Attendees year to date; one session

## $75 \%$

Attendees who've submitted an application

Offering professional development to passive candidates doesn't necessarily require a large investment of time and energy. Perhaps the easiest approach is to tap into ongoing learning and development opportunities. Ask yourself: which ongoing courses or lectures might appeal to passive candidates in your market? How can you publicize these events?

A second low-effort way to offer professional development to passive candidates is for HR staff to teach and host events. HR staff can offer classes that will be of great interest to students and entry-level staff, for instance: personal branding, interviewing, and career pathing.

## Plugging into Existing Efforts and Expertise

## Current Efforts

## Continuing Education Classes

HR taps into classes offered to employees for CEUs and opens a few spots to the public

## Professional Lectures

Recruiters open organization's upcoming lectures on health care topics to the public

## Community Health Events

Recruiters leverage community health events to network with potential employees (e.g., diabetes awareness event)

## HR Expertise

## Personal Branding

Recruiters teach attendees how to set up a Linkedln page or connect on other social media sites

## Mock Interviewing \& <br> Resume Review

Recruiter and hiring managers host mock interviews and/or resume review session

## Career Planning

Organizational development shares how to take advantage of growth opportunities in health care and write your own individual development plan

## Practice 11

## Employee Referral Program

## Practice in Brief

HR leaders standardize and simplify their employee referral program.

## Rationale

Employees are the largest potential source of referrals. However, many organizations struggle to realize the full potential of their employee referral program because their program is too complicated to efficiently and consistently administer.

## Implementation Components

## Component 1: Establish a Consistent Bonus Structure and Payout

HR leaders determine a sustainable, standard referral payout.

## Component 2: Streamline Attribution and Tracking

HR modifies the referral process so that employees do not need to submit a referral and instead rely on candidates to identify the employee who referred them.

## Component 3: Keep Referrals Top-of-Mind for Employees

HR uses targeted campaigns to remind staff about the referral program.

## Practice Assessment

This is a highly recommended strategy for any organization that has an existing employee referral program. None of these changes require extensive time or resources, and they can significantly increase the return on investment ( ROI ) of your current program.

## HR Advancement Center Grades

Practice Impact: A
Ease of Implementation: B+

## Component 1: Establish a Consistent Bonus Structure and Payout

The first component of this practice is to standardize your bonus structure and payout. This means taking a consistent approach to how much you pay for specific roles and when you pay the bonus to the referrer. Ideally, you want the bonus structure to be standardized across the entire organization. It should be easy enough that employees know off-hand how much they will be paid for a given role. If too much effort is required to figure it out, they may lose interest in the program.

At Scripps Health, headquartered in San Diego, CA, HR implemented a simple two-tiered structure for employee referrals. For successful referrals, employees receive at a minimum $\$ 500$ for any role or $\$ 1,000$ if the role is hard to fill. The recruitment teams designate hard-to-fill roles based on time-to-fill and the candidate pipeline.
Employees receive their payout once the new hire has been in seat for 90 days.

## Setting a System-Wide Standard for Incentives

## Considerations for Referral Incentives



## Bonus Structure Questions

Tiered model based on role or flat rate?

Payouts for all positions or those in demand?


## Payout Timeline Question

What is the length of time before referring employee is paid?

Scripps’ Answers

## Paying for All Successful Referrals

Tiered model with \$1,000 bonuses for hard-to-fill roles and $\$ 500$ for all other roles

## Prioritizing Early Retention

Referring employee is paid once new hire is in seat for three months

## Case in Brief: Scripps Health

- Five-hospital health system headquartered in San Diego, California
- Applicants submit referrals; referrers are paid at the new hire's 90-day mark either $\$ 1,000$ for hard-to-fill roles or $\$ 500$ for all other roles
- Grew employee referral program with a series of quarterly prizes for referrals; sustain program with email communications and connecting with new hires via social media
- Attributes $30 \%$ of their external hires to their employee referral program


## Component 2: Streamline Attribution and Tracking

The second component is to streamline attribution and tracking. We recommend asking the candidate to submit their referrer's name (rather than asking current employees to submit referrals).

When candidates apply at Scripps, they submit their referring employee's name in their application. This has at least two significant benefits. First, this allows applicants to credit employees who referred candidates through social media or other indirect means. Second, this process is easier for HR to manage. Recruiters only update a referring employee oncewhen the candidate is hired.

## At Scripps, Simplifying Attribution and Tracking

## Typical Employee-Driven Referral Submission

(1) Formal Connection Required

Candidate and current employee speak about current open opportunities

2 Employee Submits Referral
Employee goes on company intranet and submits referral's name, resume, and potentially a short blurb about them

3 HR Updates Employee and Candidate
Employee and candidate expect communication from HR about the referral's application progress

## Scripps' Candidate-Driven Referral Submission

1 Informal Connection Permissible
Candidate and current employee speak about current openings or candidate hears about the position indirectly through a current employee (e.g., social media)

2 Candidate Submits Referrer
Candidate submits application and includes the referrer's name on the application

## 3 HR Focuses on Candidate

HR not obligated to update current employee until the referral is hired

## Component 3: Keep Referrals Top-of-Mind for Employees

The final component is to remind employees of the benefits of submitting referrals. We recommend staging publicity based on your program's maturity level. If you have low employee participation, you may need to have targeted campaigns with larger incentives that spur employee enthusiasm about referrals. Once you're getting a steady stream of referrals, you can default to options such as reminders via email or intranet.

When Scripps was first launching their program, they held organization-wide raffles, entering employees into a raffle each time they submitted a referral. Participants could win \$2,500 in a quarterly drawing or \$10,000 in an annual drawing. These higher-investment strategies helped Scripps build momentum and get employees invested in submitting referrals. Because their program is now well-established, Scripps no longer has to pursue large scale campaigns like a raffle. Instead Scripps keeps the referral program top of mind by sharing stories in their newsletters and getting new hires involved in referrals early on.

## Keeping the Referral Program Fresh at Scripps

| Ongoing Reminders |
| :--- |
| to Keep Referrals |
| Top-of-Mind |

Recruiters at Scripps ensure they continue to receive new referrals by introducing the program to new hires early in their onboarding. Following orientation, Scripps' recruiters send this email to their new hires to give them concrete, actionable suggestions for how to make referrals. For example, recruiters remind new hires to consider people who they meet in any classes they are taking in the community.

Scripps' Email Scripting available at advisory.com/ hrac/wintalent

Scripps is benefiting from their standardized and straightforward employee referral program. At Scripps, one in three external hires comes from the referral program. In 2015, employees earned \$180,000 in referral bonuses. In addition, leaders at Scripps believe referred hires are more loyal, and referring employees feel more invested in the new hire's experience.

## Tapping New Hires as Referral Champions

Greetings Mack,
I hope you're enjoying your first week with Scripps. Don't forget that Scripps has an excellent referral program that allows you to earn up to $\$ 1,000$ for each referral. If you have any nursing friends that are seeking per diem, part-time, or full-time positions within the organization, they can email their resume to me at bestrecruiterever@hospital.org.

Here are some great tips for referring:

- Do the club circuit - Talk up Scripps to your book club, tennis club, softball team, alumni association, and so on. Most positions are filled through word-of-mouth.
- Be a good scout - Scout out people in your church, school, or community who have skills we need at Scripps. Give them a referral card with your name on it and encourage them to apply.
- Make part-time pay off - Do you have neighbors retiring soon? Maybe they would like to stay active with a part-time job.
- Go to the head of the class - Taking classes or training workshops? Chances are some classmates are job-hunting. Spread the word that Scripps is hiring-and you have the inside scoop.


## It Pays To Know People Who Know People

## Percentage of External Hires Attributed to Employee Referrals at Scripps

FY 2015


## Practice 12

## Under-Tapped Candidate Pools

## Practice in Brief

HR removes barriers that prevent qualified candidates who belong to overlooked groups from being hired.

## Rationale

Nearly every labor market contains pools of potential talent that health care organizations are overlooking. These groups may be deliberately overlooked (because they contain an attribute the organization has decided disqualifies candidates) or accidentally overlooked. With the labor market tightening, HR leaders need to identify ways to attract qualified individuals who belong to these overlooked groups.

## Implementation Options

## Option 1: Partner with a Community Agency to Provide Job Assistance

HR works with a community organization to offer qualified candidates (from otherwise overlooked talent pools) assistance with the application process.

## Option 2: Offer Internship Opportunities

HR creates an internship designed to attract qualified candidates from an otherwise overlooked talent pool. The internship should be designed to serve as a stepping stone to a full-time role.

## Option 3: Revise Minimum Qualifications

HR leaders consider which minimum qualifications-particularly for entry-level roles-can be revised without compromising the quality of hire.

## Option 4: Reconsider What Should Disqualify a Candidate

HR leaders review attributes that currently disqualify a candidate in their application or background check. HR leaders consider how to conduct a more nuanced, case-by-case review of otherwise qualified candidates' background.

## Practice Assessment

These are all highly effective options for hiring otherwise overlooked candidates. Each option is progressively more resource intensive, and each option faces a progressively greater risk of push-back. However, organizations who pursue options \#3 and \#4 report it is nearly always worth the investment and effort. These otherwise overlooked candidates are especially loyal and grateful for an employment opportunity that wasn't previously available to them.

## HR Advancement Center Grades

Practice Impact: A-
Ease of Implementation: B-

## Option 1: Partner with a Community Agency to Provide Job Assistance

HR partners with a community agency to provide candidates assistance with the job application process. The community partner should have a demonstrated ability to reach an underrepresented group your organization is interested in attracting.

Johns Hopkins Hospital in Baltimore, Maryland started the HopkinsLocal initiative with a goal to increase hiring from 16 economically disadvantaged zip codes in the city. Hopkins aims to fill $40 \%$ of targeted entry-level roles from these zip codes by 2018 .

Hopkins works with a local workforce development agency to help recruit, screen, and refer candidates from these areas. This agency ensures that applicants are prepared for the application and interview process.

## Taking a Closer Look at People in Our Neighborhood



## $+$

## Case in Brief: Johns Hopkins Hospital

- 998-bed academic medical center based in Baltimore, MD
- In 2015, launched HopkinsLocal an initiative to invest in Baltimore City
- Organization committed to increase hiring in 16 economically-depressed zip codes; with a goal to fill $40 \%$ of targeted entry-level roles from these areas by 2018
- A workforce development agency assists in recruiting, screening, and referring candidates for the targeted entry-level positions
- Recruitment staff promote initiative in local faith-based organizations and through other community partners


## Option 2: Offer Internship Opportunities

HR creates an internship or a temporary job assignment designed to offer overlooked candidates an opportunity to polish their skills and get an introduction to the organization. HR should prioritize departments where full-time opportunities are available to participants who are interested and qualified.

At Stanford Health Care based in Stanford, CA HR partnered with Npower, a national nonprofit that helps people develop information technology (IT) skills. They sponsored 20 veterans for a 20-week program that included 13 weeks of classroom tech training and a seven-week internship. Of the veterans who interned at Stanford in their IT department, five were ultimately hired as Service Desk Agents.

## Taking a Closer Look at Veterans



## $\ddagger$

## Case in Brief: Stanford Health Care

- 613-bed academic health system based in Stanford, CA
- Partnered with NPower to sponsor 20 veteran participants in The Technology Service Corps San Francisco Bay Area program
- Stanford invested $\$ 27,500$ in the 20 -week IT skill development program
- Veteran participants completed 13 weeks of class-based training and a seven-week long internship at one of the sponsor organizations
- Stanford ultimately hired five veterans for IT roles as Service Desk Agents


## Option 3: Revise Minimum Qualifications

HR leaders review qualifications for entry-level roles to determine if minimum qualifications can be modified to allow for motivated but currently underqualified talent to be considered. Typically, you should look to modify experience requirements (e.g., two years of experience for an entry-level role) or education requirements for entry-level roles.

HR leaders at Missouri Health Care in Columbia, MO realized they were missing an opportunity to recruit highperforming high school students who did not go directly to college. The Director of Talent Acquisition knew they could offer a competitive salary and benefits (e.g., tuition assistance) for high school graduates. The organization changed their experience requirement for specific entry-level roles (e.g., phlebotomy, unit clerk, or nursing support) so that high school graduates could apply.

## Taking a Closer Look at High School Graduates



## Case in Brief: University of Missouri Health Care

- Academic health system based in Columbia, MO
- Identified 10 roles that could be filled with high school students not planning to go to college, including: CNA, surgical technician, and administrative positions
- Organization changed level of experience required for some roles so high school students could apply
- HR delivers presentations in high schools to build awareness about health care career paths


## Option 4: Reconsider What Should Disqualify a Candidate

HR leaders reconsider what currently disqualifies candidates in their application or background check.

Leaders at Johns Hopkins decided that a criminal background should not automatically disqualify an otherwise qualified candidate. Once a hiring manager extends an offer, Johns Hopkins uses a background security screener to evaluate the candidate's criminal offense based on several factors-when it happened, type of offense, if the candidate disclosed the offense-and make a final hiring recommendation.

Regardless of if the candidate is hired, the hiring manager is not informed of the candidate's criminal background. As of 2016, roughly ten percent of Johns Hopkins' workforce have a criminal background.

## Taking a Closer Look at Candidates with a Criminal Background

Job Description<br>Job Title: Background Security Screener<br>Department: Human Resources<br>Position Summary:

- Reviews background investigations on all new hires for all affiliates.
- Makes recommendations to HR on disposition of candidates showing negative information on their background reports.
- Collects additional information to clarify information received from the background company and investigates further as needed, based on state requirements or position-specific requirements


## Case in Brief: Johns Hopkins Hospital

- In 1996 began reviewing criminal background checks on a case-bycase basis after realizing that many applicants for entry-level roles had a former offense
- Johns Hopkins Hospital made hiring ex-offenders an intentional part of their workforce strategy to provide opportunities to talent often overlooked in the community
- Hired an ex-police officer as a background screener to assess the details of past convictions for candidates with criminal records and make recommendations about their suitability as employees
- Candidates proceed through full hiring process, receive an offer, then undergo a criminal background check; hiring managers only informed if the candidate is not approved in the pre-employment process


## Want more on attracting and retaining the right staff?

This study is a publication of the HR Advancement Center, a division of Advisory Board. As a member of the HR Advancement Center, you have access to a wide variety of resources, including webconferences, studies, toolkits, our blog, and more. Check out some of our other resources on attracting and retaining the right staff.

## 是里  <br> Benchmarks: Annual Turnover, Vacancy and Premium Labor Benchmarks

Benchmark your performance on turnover, vacancy and premium labor. Use our interactive benchmark generator to find the numbers you need on key performance metrics. You can filter the data by region, organization type, size, and union status.


Toolkit: The Behavioral-Based Interviewing Toolkit
Find everything you need to design, introduce and sustain behavioralbased interviewing at your institution.


## Toolkit: HR's Guide to New Hire Onboarding

Use this toolkit to quickly and efficiently build the infrastructure for a strong onboarding program.


